

# **RACISM AND CULTURAL DIVERSITY IN THE MASS MEDIA**

An overview of research and  
examples of good practice  
in the EU Member States, 1995-2000

on behalf of the

European Monitoring Centre  
on Racism and Xenophobia, Vienna  
(EUMC)

by

European Research Centre  
on Migration and Ethnic Relations  
(ERCOMER)

Edited by Jessika ter Wal

Vienna, February 2002

## DISCLAIMER

---

This Report has been carried out by the European Research Centre on Migration and Ethnic Relations (ERCOMER) on behalf of the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC). The opinions expressed by the authors do not necessarily reflect the position of the EUMC.

Reproduction is authorized, except for commercial purposes, provided the source is acknowledged and the attached text accompanies any reproduction: "This study has been carried out on behalf of the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia (EUMC). The opinions expressed by the authors do not necessarily reflect the position of the EUMC."

## PREFACE

The research interest in analysing the way mass media report on ethnic issues has increased in the Member States over the last decades. And for this reason the EUMC decided to bring together the major research reports and their findings over the last five years in this report "RACISM AND CULTURAL DIVERSITY IN THE MASS MEDIA - an overview of research and examples of good practice in the EU Member States, 1995-2000".

The project has been carried out by Dr Jessika ter Wal, at Ercomer, Utrecht University, the Netherlands. I would like to express my sincere gratitude to her for her excellent work. The report underlines the importance of media research in the area of racism and diversity.

The mass media, and especially the news media, have an unequivocal position in society when it comes to establishing and disseminating common cultural references. The mass media have an influence on people's attitudes as well as our common knowledge, but not always in the expected and desired ways.

The active democratic role of the mass media in society can be influenced by a number of factors. The way the mass media represent, focus and give voice to different actors and incidents in society could have the unintentional result of strengthening a racist discourse instead of fighting against it. Mass media reporting is especially sensitive when it comes to ethnic, cultural and religious relations in our society.

The mass media organisations in the Member States take different initiatives to promote cultural, ethnic and religious diversity, such as developing codes of conduct, recruiting broadcasters from the migrant and minority communities and training the personnel from multiethnic societies.

The report has already attracted a lot of interest from researchers, from journalists as well as from media organisations. I hope that the report will be of practical use to all those interested in the fight against racism and especially those working in the media.

Beate Winkler

Director of the EUMC

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	INTRODUCTION .....	11
	by Jessika ter Wal	
1.1	Aims of the study .....	11
1.2	How the study was conducted .....	12
1.3	Existing international initiatives to promote good practice .	19
1.4	Problems related to the comparability of data .....	10
1.5	Overview .....	23
	Table 1. Dimensions, specific media practices, factors and related types of data .....	26
2	CONCLUSIONS .....	31
	by Jessika ter Wal	
2.1	AN INVENTORY OF THE EXISTING RESEARCH .....	32
2.1.1	Disparities in available research .....	32
2.1.2	Type of research and approach .....	33
2.1.3	Ideological differences .....	34
2.1.4	Coding Methods in Quantitative Research - problems of reliability .....	35
2.1.5	Limits of quantitative analyses and coding .....	35
2.2	NEGATIVE NEWS MAKING-RELATED MECHANISMS .....	36
2.2.1	Media panics and fixed repertoires .....	36
2.2.2	Media and politics .....	37
2.2.3	Different newspaper types .....	39
2.2.4	News genres selection .....	40
2.2.5	Problem of reliable information .....	40
2.2.6	Quotation/Source use .....	40
2.3	COMMON TRENDS IN PORTRAYAL .....	42
2.3.1	Crime themes .....	43
2.3.2	Description of problems related to ethnic relations .....	45
2.3.3	Description of problems related to immigration and asylum	46
2.3.4	Portrayal and perspective .....	47
2.3.5	Focus on special groups and boundary markers .....	48
2.3.6	Labelling .....	50
2.4	DISTINCTIONS BETWEEN MORE POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE INSTANCES .....	52
2.4.1	Variation depending on media type and genre .....	52
2.4.2	Subtle and blatant racism .....	53
2.4.3	Different groups .....	54

2.4.4	Headlines .....	54
2.5	POSITIONS TOWARDS RACISM AND ANTI-RACISM .....	55
2.5.1	Right-wing extremism and populism .....	57
2.5.2	Racist crimes (violence and harassment) .....	58
2.5.3	Anti-racism .....	59
2.6	TRACING DEVELOPMENTS .....	61
2.6.1	Subtle/new racism .....	62
2.6.2	Negative developments .....	63
2.6.3	Positive developments in thematic change or media sensitivity .....	63
2.6.4	Parallel developments over longer periods of time .....	66
2.6.5	Development in reporting on specific cases or groups .....	67
2.7	MEDIA EFFECTS .....	68
2.8	POSITIVE ACTIONS TO COMBAT RACISM AND PROMOTE CULTURAL DIVERSITY .....	71
2.8.1	Codex of conduct .....	71
3	RECOMMENDATIONS by the European Monitoring Centre on Racism and Xenophobia .....	75
3.1	GENERAL REMARKS.....	75
3.2	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR RESEARCH AND MONITORING ....	78
3.3	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR MEDIA PROFESSIONALS .....	79
3.3.1	Source use .....	79
3.3.2	Sources and participation .....	80
3.3.3	Formats and genres .....	81
3.3.4	Groups - Portrayal .....	83
3.4	POLICIES FOR PROMOTING DIVERSITY .....	84
3.5	VIGILANCE OF ELECTRONIC MEDIA .....	86
3.6	REFERENCES .....	87
4	MEMBER STATE REPORTS .....	89
4.1	BELGIUM (BE) .....	90
	by Frieda Saeys and Tomas Coppens	
4.1.1	Introduction .....	90
4.1.2	Representation of Ethnic Minorities in the media .....	91
4.1.3	Media discourse analysis - 'Debating Diversity' .....	97
4.1.4	Actions to combat racism and discrimination in the media .	99
4.1.5	Conclusions .....	101
4.1.6	References .....	102
4.1.7	Contact addresses .....	104

4.2	DENMARK (DA) .....	107
	by Mustafa Hussain	
4.2.1	Introduction .....	107
4.2.2	Portrayal in the mass media .....	107
4.2.3	Recognition of the problem and good practice .....	117
4.2.4	Concluding remarks .....	121
4.2.5	References .....	122
4.3	GERMANY (DE) .....	125
	by Joachim Trebbe and Tobias Köhler	
4.3.1	Introduction .....	125
4.3.2	General media practices .....	127
4.3.3	The reproduction of ethnic and racist prejudice .....	136
4.3.4	Initiatives to promote cultural diversity and combat racism .....	138
4.3.5	Concluding remarks .....	143
4.3.6	References .....	144
4.3.7	Internet addresses .....	148
4.4	GREECE (EL) .....	149
	by Anna Triandafyllidou	
4.4.1	A brief introduction to Greece and its minorities .....	150
4.4.2	Media practices in reporting on ethnic issues .....	152
4.4.3	The reproduction of ethnic and racial stereotypes .....	159
4.4.4	Media initiatives to combat racism .....	164
4.4.5	Conclusions .....	165
4.4.6	References .....	166
4.4.7	Contact addresses .....	170
4.5	SPAIN (ES) .....	173
	by Antonio Miguel Bañon Hernandez	
4.5.1	Researchers and research groups .....	174
4.5.2	Research by associations and NGO'S .....	183
4.5.3	Initiatives of the media .....	191
4.5.4	Government and trade unions .....	194
4.5.5	Conclusions .....	198
4.5.6	References .....	199
4.6	FRANCE (FR) .....	203
	by Alec G. Hargreaves	
4.6.1	Introduction .....	203
4.6.2	Media representations .....	203
4.6.3	Media effects .....	209

4.6.4	Actions to promote cultural diversity and combat racism ...	211
4.6.5	Conclusions .....	214
4.6.6	References .....	215
4.6.7	Contact addresses .....	218
4.7	IRELAND (IR) .....	221
	by Gary Quinn and Ciarán Ó Mailán	
4.7.1	A diverse Ireland .....	221
4.7.2	Legislative framework for racism and the media .....	224
4.7.3	Defining ethnic minorities in the news .....	226
4.7.4	Common trends .....	229
4.7.5	Credible sources .....	232
4.7.6	Journalism constraints and guidelines .....	233
4.7.7	Monitoring .....	235
4.7.8	Conclusions .....	237
4.7.9	References .....	237
4.7.10	Contact addresses .....	238
4.8	ITALY (IT) .....	239
	by Jessika ter Wal	
4.8.1	General media practices .....	240
4.8.2	Main themes and portrayal .....	241
4.8.3	Initiatives to combat racism and promote cultural diversity	259
4.8.4	Concluding remarks .....	262
4.8.5	References .....	264
4.8.6	Contact addresses .....	270
4.9	LUXEMBOURG (LU) .....	273
	by Nénad Dubajic	
4.9.1	Introduction .....	273
4.9.2	General information on media .....	274
4.9.3	Media representations .....	276
4.9.4	Initiatives to combat racism and promote cultural diversity	278
4.9.5	Concluding remarks .....	282
4.9.6	References .....	284
4.9.7	Contact addresses .....	286
4.10	THE NETHERLANDS (NE) .....	287
	by Ineke van der Valk	
4.10.1	Introduction .....	287
4.10.2	Research overview until 1997 .....	288
4.10.3	Portrayal of ethnic minorities .....	290

4.10.4	Studies on media effects .....	296
4.10.5	Initiatives to promote diversity and balanced reporting .....	298
4.10.6	Concluding remarks .....	302
4.10.7	References .....	304
4.10.8	Contact addresses .....	308
4.11	AUSTRIA (OE) .....	311
	by Alexander Joskowicz	
4.11.1	Introduction .....	311
4.11.2	The media market and its regulations on reporting .....	312
4.11.3	Ethnic and racial stereotypes in the media .....	314
4.11.4	Initiatives to promote cultural diversity and combat racism	322
4.11.5	References .....	324
4.12	PORTUGAL (PO) .....	327
	by Anabela Franqueira	
4.12.1	Introduction .....	327
4.12.2	The representation of immigrants and ethnic minorities ...	335
4.12.3	Positive actions to promote cultural diversity and combat racism .....	340
4.12.4	Concluding remarks .....	347
4.12.5	References .....	348
4.13	FINLAND (SU) .....	351
	by Karina Horsti	
4.13.1	Introduction: Cultural diversity in Finland .....	351
4.13.2	Establishing the field of ethnic studies .....	352
4.13.3	The reproduction of ethnic stereotypes in the media .....	354
4.13.4	The role of journalistic practises and routines .....	364
4.13.5	Media use by immigrants .....	366
4.13.6	Initiatives for more balanced reporting .....	367
4.13.7	References .....	369
4.14	SWEDEN (SV) .....	373
	by Ylva Brune	
4.14.1	General findings on news coverage .....	373
4.14.2	News media depictions of racism and Xenophobia .....	381
4.14.3	Initiatives to promote cultural diversity in the media and to improve news reporting .....	387
4.14.4	Education and vocational training .....	390
4.14.5	Conclusions .....	390
4.14.6	References .....	391

4.15	UNITED KINGDOM (UK) .....	395
	by Paul Statham	
4.15.1	Introduction - research context in Britain .....	395
4.15.2	Coverage, topics and sources .....	399
4.15.3	Themes, framing and labelling .....	406
4.15.4	Media initiatives to promote cultural diversity .....	411
4.15.5	The need for politically relevant research .....	416
4.15.6	References .....	418
5	APPENDIX .....	421
5.1	CONCEPTUAL AND METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK .....	421
	by Jessika ter Wal	
5.1.1	The concept of racism .....	334
5.2	Media and racism .....	423
5.2.1	Studying media treatment of racism .....	423
5.2.2	Racism, denial and anti-racism .....	424
5.2.3	Prejudiced attitudes and social representations .....	425
5.3	MAIN THEORETICAL APPROACHES .....	426
5.3.1	Minorities and the media' approach.....	427
5.3.2	News-making approach .....	429
5.3.3	Social constructionist approach .....	432
5.3.4	Discourse analytical approach.....	434
5.3.5	News and public attitudes approach .....	436
5.3.6	Other approaches .....	440
5.3.7	Summary .....	441
5.4	METHODS FOR ANALYSIS .....	441
5.4.1	Extensive analysis and case studies .....	442
5.4.2	Content analysis .....	444
5.4.3	News-making related questions.....	447
5.4.4	Social construction .....	447
5.4.5	Discourse analysis.....	448
5.4.6	Public attitudes.....	453
5.5	REFERENCES .....	454
5.6	LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS – AUTHORS' ADDRESSES .....	458

## 4.12 PORTUGAL (PT)

Anabela Franqueira

*University of Coimbra, Centre for Migration Studies*

### 4.12.1 INTRODUCTION

#### 4.12.1.1 THE POSITION OF IMMIGRANTS AND ETHNIC MINORITIES IN PORTUGAL

In the last 25 years, Portugal, like the other countries of the southern Mediterranean, has witnessed a new phenomenon: beyond the condition of country of emigration, it became at the same time a country of immigration. There was a very large flow of African immigrants, particularly coming from the former Portuguese colonies. Table 1 shows that since the 1980s Portugal has seen a steady increase in foreign residents, and comparing these figures with the data on Portuguese emigration in Table 2, we see that in the same period immigration started to exceed emigration. Table 3 shows the high proportion, since 1980, of immigrants from African countries, as compared with those from Europe and Southern America. According to the most recent data, available for 31 December 1999, the percentage of foreign residents in the total population (of 10 million inhabitants) is of 1.9 per cent (Instituto Nacional de Estatística, 2000: 35).

**Table 1.** Evolution of foreign legal residents

YEAR	1960	1975	1980	1985	1990	1995	1999
FOREIGN POPULATION	29,000	32,000	50,750	79,594	107,767	168,316	190,896

*Source: For years 1960-1975, Baganha, Marques and Fonseca (2000: 11); for years 1980-1999, Serviço de Estrangeiros e Fronteiras (2000: 14).*

**Table 2.** Evolution of Portuguese emigration <sup>101</sup>

YEAR	1956-60	6-65	66-70	71-75	76-80	81-85	86	87	88	92-95
AVERAGE OF EMIGRANTS PER YEAR	32,400	50,300	85,900	50,800	18,400	7,200	6,300	8,100	9,500	31,000

*Source: For the years 1956-1988, do Céu Esteves (1991: 6-8); for the years 1992-1995 Garcia (2000: 53-56).*

**Table 3.** Evolution of the percentage of main foreign groups

YEAR	AFRICANS	EUROPEANS	SOUTH AMERICANS
1960	1,5%	67%	22%
1980	48%	31%	11%
1999	47%	30%	14%

*Source: For the years 1960 and 1980 Baganha, Marques and Fonseca (2000: 11); For 1999, Serviço de Estrangeiros e Fronteiras (2000: 14).*

Immigration to Portugal before 1980 involved different groups (mainly Europeans and South Americans, in particular Brazilian immigrants), and a different socio-economic integration, than the immigrants who came to Portugal after that date (predominantly Africans).

If until mid 1980s the population of non-European origin (either Portuguese or foreign nationality) does not present particular problems of integration into the Portuguese society, revealing a great capacity of adaptation, thanks to the high professional qualifications, a strong entrepreneurial capacity, and privileged links with the ethnic communities of origin [...], after the mid 1980s, the same situation is no longer visible. To this contributes the increase of foreigners in Portugal with minor job qualifications and less economic resources, while with the progressive integration into the European Union a great phase of economic growth started and the demand for labour increased. (Marques and Santos, 1999: 2).

<sup>101</sup> Until 1988 the Support Institute to Emigration and Portuguese Communities documented the statistics on Portuguese emigration. With the entry into the European Union and the abolition of passports (Law Decree number 433/ 88), the collection of this data was interrupted. In 1992, the National Institute of Statistics took up again the collection of data on the basis of a national survey.

That is, the occupational structure of the foreign population, when compared to that of the domestic population, was biased both towards the top (Brazilian and European immigrants) and towards the bottom (immigrants from former Portuguese colonies in Africa) of the occupational ladder (Baganha, Marques and Fonseca, 2000). Immigrants of African origin mainly come to Portugal to work in public constructions, occupying the places left available by the Portuguese emigration to Europe, also in domestic labour and in restoration, mostly in degrading working conditions. Therefore, immigrants of African origin do not really occupy labour vacancies needed for the Portuguese, and the identification of foreigners as a cause of problems such as unemployment is thus not justified and indicates that their vital importance for the national economy is not recognised.

The most recent immigration to Portugal comes from Eastern Europe. Since the enforcement of the law number 4, on 10 January 2001, (at the moment of writing two months) already 24,125 immigrants have legalised their position; most of them are of Eastern European origin.<sup>102 103</sup> This law introduced changes to law number 244 of 8 August 1998, that regulates the conditions of entry, stay, leaving and withdrawal of foreigners from national territory<sup>104</sup>. The significant changes regarded the introduction of a new article (number 55), which states that foreign citizens without a work visa are able to apply for a work permit as long as they have a labour contract (*autorização de permanência*), which is issued for the period of one year and renewed for a maximum of five years.

The action of the Government in matters of immigration and ethnic minorities obeys the Constitutional principles of equality and non-discrimination of citizens, regarding 'race' (article 13 of the Portuguese Republic Constitution) and to the Principle of equalisa-

---

102 During the 1990s two procedures to legalise immigrants were enacted in Portugal. The first one was in 1992, when approximately 39,000 immigrants obtained legal status, and the second one was in 1996, here 35,000 individuals were granted a residence permit.

103 Until 8 March 2001, 7,210 foreigners from Ukraine, 1,040 from Russia, 1,543 from Romania and 2,055 from Moldavia have legalised their status.

104 Literal translation of the name of law, Lei de Entrada, Permanência, Saída e Afastamento de Estrangeiros de Território Nacional.

tion of Rights between nationals and foreigners (article 15 of the Portuguese Constitution) with the exceptions foreseen in the Constitution and in the law.

Nevertheless, one cannot ignore the difficulties in the practical implementation of these principles. These problems are due to the late recognition of the need to introduce measures for the integration of immigrants and the aggravation of the effects of processes of social exclusion (such as in the labour market, housing and healthcare), that are now more difficult to revert.

In 1995, the programme of the Socialist Party referred for the first time to the integration of immigrants and ethnic minorities. In the same year, the government appointed a High Commissioner for Immigration and Ethnic Minorities (HCIEM), which forms part of the Presidency of the Council of Ministers. The creation of this organisation was due to the recognition of the 'new challenges faced by Portugal as a country of immigration, which requires social integration measures for migrant families and ethnic minorities in general, in order to avoid situations of social exclusion that generate racism and xenophobia.'<sup>105</sup> The High Commissioner's mandate is to accompany and support at interministerial level the integration of immigrants. As Marques and Santos (1999: 3) pointed out, 'with the creation of the High Commissioner for Immigrants and Ethnic Minorities in 1995, the public powers have recognised what until then had been banished to the category of "virtual reality"'.

The HCIEM collaborates with immigrant and ethnic minorities associations, social partners, governmental departments and public administration, with the aim of contributing to:

- improve the living conditions of immigrants in Portugal, in such a way as to ensure their integration into society while respecting their original identity and culture;
- contribute to ensuring that all citizens who legally reside in Portugal enjoy an identical degree of dignity and opportuni-

---

105 See the Law by Decree number 3-A/ 96, of 26 of January.

ties, in such a way as to eliminate discrimination and fight racism and xenophobia;

- supervise the action of the various sections of the Civil Service with responsibility for the entry of foreign citizens to Portugal, their stay and departure, while respecting the competencies of those departments and of the members of the Government who are specifically charged with such matters;
- collaborate in defining and ensuring the supervision and stimulation of policies intended to actively combat exclusion;
- propose measures - particularly those of a normative nature - designed to assist immigrants and ethnic minorities.

Integration is a process in which both immigrants and ethnic minorities aim at a full participation as citizens in the society in which they live. Even when the logic of the politics of integration - as in Portugal - *is to promote the integration as individual citizen*, it is always possible to the immigrant or the ethnic minority to adopt a more individualistic or more communitarian strategy of integration. Communities may also be more open or closed to interethnic marriages; in this respect, we have seen that African immigrants coming from countries of official Portuguese language (so called 'Palop' countries) are more open than, for example, Portuguese Roma (Leitão, 1999).

The concepts of immigrant and ethnic minorities are not synonymous. That is, immigrants can be, but need not be, part of an ethnic minority and some ethnic minorities, i.e. the Roma, can be national citizens. When we designate the Roma Community as an ethnic minority, one cannot forget the multiple meanings produced by the undifferentiated of the concept of ethnic minority, on the one hand, and that of immigrant, on the other, which imply necessarily rights of a different nature to each of them. This confusion does not allow an adequate analysis of the migratory phenomenon and at the same time prevents the independent consideration of specific problems of the ethnic minorities (Leitão, 2000).

The Roma community has been in Portugal since the fifteen century and they are considered as Portuguese citizens, at least since the

Portuguese Constitution of 1822 and the Constitutional Charter of 1826. This legal status eliminated the inequalities regarding 'race' and has recognised the Portuguese citizenship to those born in Portuguese territory. In this sense, the nearly 40,000 thousand Portuguese Roma citizens living in Portugal have the same social dignity and are equal before the law (article 13 of the Portuguese Constitution).

The Roma community has nine associations. In addition, an association for Roma women was constituted in 2000. The Roma associations are not all exclusively constituted of members of Roma origin, as they also have non-Roma members. Two NGOs that work exclusively with this population are the *Obra Nacional da Pastoral dos Ciganos* (belonging to the Catholic Church) and the *Igreja Evangélica de Filadélfia dos Ciganos de Portugal* (Protestant Church).

A large number of non-governmental organisations are working in the area of immigration. These organisations are located primarily within the more problematic areas and neighbourhoods, where the percentage of immigrants is particularly high, and they thus concentrate on the specific problems felt by those communities. In general, all the local NGOs have as their main goal to promote the integration of immigrants into Portuguese society, such as *Associação Unidos de Cabo Verde* (Cape Verdian United Association). Other NGOs operate at the national level and function as pressure groups, promoting immigrants' rights and combating racial discrimination. Three different types of associations exist at the national level: the first dedicates its work to immigrants' rights in general (such as *Obra Católica das Migrações* - a Catholic charity institution, and trade unions which target immigrants' labour rights), the second includes organisations that deal with the rights of the main ethnic communities living in Portugal (Cape Verde Association, Guinea Association, and the *Casa do Brasil*) and the third aims to promote equality and combat discrimination against certain groups of individuals (SOS Racism and *Olho Vivo*) (Baganha, Marques and Fonseca, 2000: 45-48).

#### 4.12.1.2 LEGAL INSTRUMENTS THAT AIM TO PROMOTE THE INTEGRATION OF IMMIGRANTS

Since 1995, several legislative initiatives have been taken in order to promote the integration of immigrants and to fight discrimination and racism. First, Law number 50 of 4 September 1996 ("*Reciprocity Law*") allows citizens coming from the European Union, and also from Cape Verde, Brazil, Peru and Uruguay to vote and present themselves as candidates in local elections. Also citizens from Argentina, Norway and Israel are now allowed to vote in local elections.

Second, Law number 19-A of 29 June 1996 established for the first time in Portugal a contribution within the non-contributory scheme of social security and a programme of social integration to guarantee to individuals (with *legal residence*) and their families resources that contribute to the satisfaction of their minimum needs, in order to contribute to a positive and progressive social and professional integration.

Third, the Law number 79 of 20 June 1996 created legal support for the acquisition or the renovation of family housing (legal immigrants included) that are covered by the PER (Special Plans of Relocation) programme. The aim was to eradicate slum neighbourhoods, in those areas where they proliferate most: in the metropolitan areas of Oporto and Lisbon.

Fourth, the new Foreigners' Labour Law (Law number 20/98, of 12 May) has eliminated quantitative restrictions (*that is, discriminatory restrictions in the access to the labour market*) in the recruitment of workers, with the aim to fight employment in the informal economy. The principle of equality in recruitment and in working conditions independently from national origin, that was thus applied, is in line with the Florence Declaration defended by the European partners in October 1995.

#### 4.12.1.3 STUDIES AND DISCUSSIONS ON 'SUBTLE' RACISM

According to recent studies on racism, Portugal may constitute an example of a society that is formally anti-racist but in which racist attitudes persist (Vala, Brito and Lopes, 1999). This paradox is explained through the different concepts of racism that stem from the position one assumes towards the anti-racist social norm that has progressively developed in western societies since the Second World War and which condemns expressions of traditional racism. A concept of prejudice or flagrant racism is shown as different from subtle racism, which means that those who are subtly racist accept the anti-racist norm as a way of being socially correct and not being punished for their actions in public life. The authors conceive the non-racist as one who internalises the norm as part of a value system based on equality and who rejects all forms of racism, including those that are socially accepted. The studies mentioned before point to the conclusion that, in Portugal, as in the rest of Europe, the anti-racist social norm exists only for flagrant racism, but not for subtle racism. One could also say that in Portugal, not only is racism not an assumed attitude, but also militant racism is extremely rare (Baganha, Marques and Fonseca, 1999: 55-57).

Recently, however, this study has been criticised (Machado, 2000). The criticism is that when considering the scale used to measure the concept of subtle racism, there are some items that only by adopting a highly inflated concept of racism can be considered as indicators of racial prejudice. That is, respondents were asked to value the factual similarities or differences in the religion, language or even values taught to children in the 'black' minority culture, as opposed to the transmission of these values in the majority population. But according to Machado, the given answers cannot be taken as synonymous of prejudice, *but only as indicators of the knowledge or ignorance about objective facts*. To ask, on the other hand, if frequently one feels sympathy or admiration for this same minority does not seem to be a good way to measure prejudice either. If the expression of antipathy towards a minority group is considered as a sign of racism, then it is not acceptable to claim that racism does not exist only on the basis of the expression of general attitudes of sympathy and admiration.

## 4.12.2 THE REPRESENTATION OF IMMIGRANTS AND ETHNIC MINORITIES IN PORTUGUESE MEDIA

The production of scientific research on racism and cultural diversity in the Portuguese media is extremely limited. The information reproduced in this part of the report is the result of a factual analysis done to existing research projects concerning the role of the media in public opinion. The existing projects are found in two publications, which cover the period as of the mid 1980s until 1989, and the years 1993-1995 respectively, and one research on the 1997 coverage on anti-racism, which is reported in the following section. In this section we will also discuss the results of a workshop on Media and Racism organised in the framework of the first National Round Table held in April 2000.

### 4.12.2.1 REPRESENTATIONS IN THE PRESS UNTIL 1989

The first study was based on a press analysis of two newspapers: the daily *Diário de Notícias*, and the weekly *Expresso* (Pena Pires, 1991). The author justifies the selection of these periodicals because of their dominant reference in the social arena: they both have a large readership and circulation and they produce general information. Also, their political and public positioning - more central - may stand as a pattern in opinion making. The time frame of this research goes from January 1983 to July 1989, for *Diário de Notícias* and from January 1987 to July 1989 for *Expresso*. Although the study is published prior to 1995, is not addressing precisely the issue of racism and the Mass Media, and provides a very partial view of the issue, it nevertheless reveals some important insights into the perception that the Portuguese have of foreigners.

The author starts by making three preliminary observations. First, reports on issues concerning Africans were not frequent. Secondly, in all cases the reports adopted a "*social report*" approach, whereas no editorials were dedicated to the theme. Thirdly, in comparison with other countries of the European Union, news on Africans always appeared as isolated texts. That is, the newspapers did not publish special issues or files on issue concerning them, such as the ones that can be found in other European newspapers.

Furthermore, the analysis showed that while certain nationalities were designated, on the other hand foreigners tended to be associated with specific occupations or traits, such as students, the Islamic community, and so on. One of the categories that appeared frequently in the news (either by the frequency of the theme or by the permanence of the qualification) is that of *Africans*. Within this category, the nationality that is mentioned most frequently is that of the *Cape Verdians*, who appear almost as synonymous with the former. Regarding the attitude of the Portuguese towards this category, the information given by the analysed material expresses, on the one hand, the attitudes of the journalists and, on the other hand, the attitudes observed by them in the population. These attitudes are related to criminality and racism. Regarding criminality, a certain fear is expressed by the Portuguese population, which is criticised by the journalists as an irrational fear that they (and the part of the population they consider themselves to be part of) do not share. Regarding the problem of racism, no text was found in which this concept appears to be part of the Portuguese attitude. The information gathered results mainly from statements made by Africans that are not univocal: in some news texts, the opinions of these individuals show that there is no racism, whereas others contain statements about the existence of subtle racism in Portugal.

The attitudes clearly expressed by the journalists in the analysed texts range from *curiosity* (in the *ethnographic style* adopted in the news relating with the Cape Verdian community), and *sympathy*, in their own choice to dedicate a text to the problems of the Africans, to, finally, the *complicity* shown in the parallel established between the destiny and mood of the Portuguese, on the one hand, and that of the Africans, on the other (Pena Pires, 1991: 67-68).

This study does not allow to the conclusion that the general label of *foreign residents* does not exist as a consistent category in public opinion, nor do any clear attitudes or expectations exist regarding such a category. Moreover, social representations of *African citizens* who live in the periphery of the metropolitan areas of Lisbon and Oporto in very precarious material conditions and many times in irregular situations are well developed and have a considerable impact on public opinion. In this context, the Cape Verdian com-

munity is represented most visibly, but it is not the only one. *The attitudes portrayed in the newspapers represent a mixture of fascination and of repulsion, of sympathy and of what the press defines or classifies as racism. Regarding the other foreign communities, the representations are much more diffuse, what may be interpreted as a certain indifference, related probably to the low number of people that make up these communities (Pena Pires, 1991:72-73).*

#### 4.12.2.2 AFRICANS IN THE PORTUGUESE PRESS, 1993-1995

This research project was published in November 1996 and was the result of an analysis on a sample of eight different newspapers (four dailies, namely, *Público*, *Diário de Notícias*, *Jornal de Notícias* and *Diário Económico*, and four weeklies, namely, *Expresso*, *O Diabo*, *O Independente* and *Semanário*), from the period 1993-1995 (Cunha, 1996). The project also included a few newspapers of limited circulation that focussed on the issue of Africans in Portugal.

The first chapter of Cunha's book states that each year of the analysis matched a central problem that was thematised by the media, independently from other constant themes with the same or more importance. Thematisations depended either on extraordinary events, which made minorities object of reporting, or on the formulation of a theme by the political power and the media together. In the three years of analysis three large themes were identified in the press agenda: the case of the dislodged people in *Camarate* (housing theme), the *Vuvu* Case (legal entrance to Portuguese territory theme) and the *Bairro Alto* Case (racist murder/physical violence theme).

The analysis of the news reports started by showing two important characteristics. First, it showed that there was a constant reference to people and institutions in power, particularly political and governmental institutions. In general, limited space and little continuous attention was dedicated to the citizen, the immigrant, and the lay people; i.e. news which concentrated on their positions appears less prominently, less extensively and was dropped sooner than news on political decision-making and institutional processes. The second characteristic observed was the use of headlines and leads

with a sensationalist language, which could easily arouse alarm and even fear.

In addition, the press reports revealed an almost absence of images of Africans. In almost all images, the African, as citizen or immigrant appeared as a complement of the '*Portuguese Self*'. To this image were added stereotypes of marginality, poverty and exotism.

As the journalist Adriana Andriga states in the preface to the book, this research remembered to those newsmakers who proclaim themselves as independent and objective in newsmaking, that they also manipulate the reproduction of information (although unconsciously). On the other hand, the study also showed that the journalist is, as any other professional, a product of formal and informal socialisation. Moreover, the production of news obeys to mechanisms of unconscious manipulation, which are naturalised in the journalistic practice. Finally, the discourses produced by the mass media as well as by the opinion leaders reflect the interests, stereotypes and prejudice of the majority group.

Journalists and politicians therefore make the opinion leadership, according to this study. Their privileged access to the Media allows them to produce a discourse which reinforces the value order, the worries, the conception of the world and the beliefs of the elite. However, it seems that the representatives of associations of the civil society start having a privileged role in opinion leadership as well (Cunha, 1996).

#### 4.12.2.3 *ROUND TABLE ON RACISM AND XENOPHOBIA, WORKSHOP ON MEDIA AND RACISM*

The 1st *Portuguese Round Table on Racism and Xenophobia*, organised in April 2000, in Lisbon, had workshop dedicated to the theme of *Media and Racism*. Although the discussion and the plenary section were quite emotive, the written conclusions do not embrace all the information that was entailed in this workshop (ACIME, 2000b). The RT concluded 'subtle racism' exists in Portugal, the Portuguese society is shying at the phenomenon of racism (for it is not 'politically correct' to be racist). The Mass Media treatment

has tended towards sensationalism, thus ending up by favouring racism, either directly or indirectly. In fact, according to one of the speakers - Bruno Gonçalves, a representative of a Roma association - press articles having positive reference regarding minority groups are quite few. He furthermore observed the link established in the news between Roma and criminality. The Roma community is accused, in generalised terms, of drugs trafficking. This portrayal has occasionally produced conflict in local communities (Gonçalves, 2000).

This observation can be corroborated by a previous research project, which, on the basis of an analysis of a set of press surveys, concluded, "one may observe that the mass media often establish a clear relationship between immigrants [and/or ethnic minorities] and crime, one of the most obvious manifestations of xenophobia." (Pena Pires, in Franqueira, 1996: 70). Rui Pena Pires gives the example of the alarm constructed around riots by a group of 'black' young people that occurred in Alhos Vedros, a village near Lisbon, in 1993. In the news on this event, political leaders were reported to have accused foreigners, in public meetings, of invading Portugal and stealing jobs from the Portuguese. In the same period, the Internal Security Services produced reports on the existence of 'black' gangs, classifying them as the "main threat to the tranquillity of people, the integrity of personal belongings and public order safekeeping." (Franqueira, 1996: 72). Hence the stereotype of crime exists both for Roma people and 'black' immigrants.

Bruno Gonçalves has also added that the large majority of the press articles that regard Roma individuals (the only Portuguese ethnic minority), report on negative social aspects that do not favour the community at all, whereas only a small proportion is dedicated to cultural aspects. Furthermore, Gonçalves claims that the media, in Portugal, are far from respecting and being sensitive to the minorities. A great part of the journalists are responsible for building up the walls of intolerance with sensationalist and quite biased news that underlines more and more the stigma and the negative stereotypes attached to this minority group (ACIME, 2000b).

The other speaker of this workshop, an advertiser responsible for the production of anti-racist campaigns, Edson Ataíde, declared that advertising can also play an important role in the transmission of positive messages: it has sometimes played an important role in blocking negative values, and has used its techniques to 'sell' positive images (for instance the European Campaign "*All Different, All Equal*" or the National Campaign of the Project "*In Each Face... Equality*"<sup>107</sup>). Finally, it was stressed that *strong images* enhanced in advertising can be used to favour a positive racial and interethnic relations (ACIME, 2000a: 6-9).

### 4.12.3 POSITIVE ACTIONS TO PROMOTE CULTURAL DIVERSITY AND COMBAT RACISM

#### 4.12.3.1 THE CONFERENCE 'EDUCATION FOR TOLERANCE'

The Conference '*Education for Tolerance*' was promoted by the *Secretariado Coordenador dos Programas de Educação Multicultural* (Co-ordinator Secretariat for Multicultural Educational Programmes) of the Ministry of Education, in 1995 (Secretariado Coordenador dos Programas de Educação Multicultural, 1996). This Conference had three workshops, being the third on '*Concrete and Innovative Attitudes towards Tolerance*'; one of the papers presented in this workshop was on *The Role of the Mass Media in the Promotion of Tolerance*, presented by the journalist José Pedro Castanheira (Castanhiera, 1996). His contribution can be mainly read as a critique of the situation in Portuguese media and recommendations for improvement.

According to Castanheira, the media has as its main task to inform, to expose and to inquire on the existing reality. When considering the issue of promotion of tolerance one must face those who see the mass media from an utilitarian point of view, as a way to "straighten" or condition the world, to domesticate people and wills. To these people, the best is to not show, not to speak, not to

---

107 The slogan of the TV advertisement campaign is "Portugal is a country of many faces. To win, we need them all".

write, to hide and to ignore. This is, he says, a means of collective illusion, half way between censorship and self-censorship, and a totalitarian society. When regarding prohibition, we always know where it starts, but we never know where it ends. This is obviously a solution for intolerance. Simultaneously there are also those who see the mass media as a simple mirror of the society expecting it to be the transmitter of its values and qualities as well as its defaults and non-values. In a regime of disloyal competition where everything is a product of the laws of audience's shares, this perspective ends - like the Portuguese television experience reveals - in a show format for information (Castanheira, 1996: 138-139).

The *Public Interest* is subverted, being reduced, in a primary way, to the *audience's interests*. In this model the space and the call for tolerance is more and more restricted. It is important that the reporter does not mix up nonsense with the right of opinion; he cannot forget the circumstances of tension, the emotion and the passion when people express themselves. The journalist must always take into account present the deontological rules of his work<sup>108</sup>. If the Journalist fulfilled strictly the Deontological Code it would solve, by itself, most part of the mistakes, the misuse, the deviation and perversity of the information. The author goes on exemplifying with the reporting of an international football match between a Portuguese and an Italian team (in a very well known news radio channel in Portugal- TSF), where the Journalist covering the game ended up insulting lively the referee with several *epithets* and hysterically calling him "Turk, Turk, Turk" (Castanheira, 1996: 139-140).

In the last section of his paper, he states that with the almost exclusive interest of the political forces involved in power games and media control, with bodies of counter-power almost manipulated, with mass media companies fighting for audience rates, with a public opinion either disorganised or organised but powerless or just surrendered to the magic of TV, it would be the role of the journalist to expose this. However, the author states that he is not sure that

---

108 Taking into consideration the issue of racism, article 8, of the Journalists Deontological Code states that "the journalist must reject discriminatory treatment of people regarding colour, race, belief, nationality or sex"

the journalist wants or is willing to assume such an attitude or that he just may be able to do so. He ends his paper by claiming that he does not believe that the future to come will be very promising in this area.

#### 4.12.3.2 THE EUROPEAN YEAR AGAINST RACISM

In the framework of the European Year Against Racism, celebrated in 1997, many initiatives were organised in Portugal. Among them, the Seminar organised by the National Co-ordination Committee about *The Role of the Mass Media to Fight Racism* in October 1997, had the goal to analyse the mediatization of racism and/or racist incidents, the impact of information in prejudice and the role played by the media in influencing behaviours (unfortunately without any written documentation or conclusions). In the framework of the European Year, the exhibition *Anne Frank - a Story for the Present* was organised; it has been circulating throughout the country since November 1997 until the present. This has resulted from a protocol signed with *Anne Frank House*, in the Netherlands, with the aim to disseminate information and promote, among students and teachers, the values of tolerance and sensitivity regarding matters of racism, diversity and anti-Semitism.

The European Year Against Racism was also the basis for the development of a doctoral dissertation on the written press in Portugal (Da Costa Valente, 1998), by a student of the University of Lisbon. He made an analysis of two daily newspapers (*Público* and *Jornal de Notícias*) regarding the coverage on the issue of racism and its social representation. In this research it is assumed that in the complex information society the mass media play a central role in the reproduction of (anti) racism, due to its relation with other institutions and due to the structural influence in shaping and changing social cognition's.

The information produced in the two newspapers shows an absence of an alarmist and sensationalist news treatment. The research allows to the conclusion that the *Jornal de Notícias* has a more conservative speech (showing some apprehension in the approach to the phenomenon) and is more centralised at the

regional level, while the *Público* has a more modern and heterogeneous discourse. Racism is a theme that deserves being commented by specialists in the area, either to explain it, or to focus on a more concrete subject, for example the position of the Roma community.

According to the author, the analysis of the opinions and values expressed by the two newspapers shows that both disapproves of racist behaviours and represents the Roma community and "black" people as the main victims of intolerance and racial discrimination. On the basis of the reports in the *Jornal de Notícias* it was possible to conclude that, in general, the Portuguese do not have racist behaviours and when they show such behaviour, this is not a reason for concern. On the other hand, the analysis of the *Público* reports reveals the existence of racist behaviours in the country, acknowledged as a reason for concern and reflection on the issue. The results produced by the analysis show that the two newspapers produce similar discourses, when the repulsion of racism and the need to fight it is concerned. In general, it is possible to conclude that the written press produces an anti-racist speech, but the Portuguese society is represented as being a vehicle of certain racist behaviours. Nevertheless, on the basis of the press analysis it was possible to conclude that, in general, there is no attitude of rejection towards immigrant communities, despite some concern regarding the future of the Portuguese society. In this sense, it is legitimate to conclude that in the two newspapers analysed racism in the Portuguese society is of a rather dissimulated and implicit form. However, it can be said that the media tended to emphasise anti-racist discourses, and that this anti-racist orientation characterised the period under analysis (da Costa Valente, 1998: 90-96).

#### 4.12.3.3 FORUM FOR THE MASS MEDIA

In February 1998, the High Authority for the Mass Media organised a *Forum for the Mass Media*, with nine different workshops. One of the workshops discussed the issue of 'The Role of the Mass Media and the Rights of Minority Groups. This workshop called attention to negative media practices. Indeed, it was found that the Mass Media frequently follow the uniformity of the globalisation process,

with a discourse that tends to reflect many of the social doubts and ambiguities regarding minorities. The media were also criticised of transmitting and magnifying dominant stereotypes and prejudice. Furthermore, behind a claim of objectivity may be hidden indifference, marginalisation or even intolerance towards these groups. It is difficult to find reports on the problems and points of view of the minority groups as well as their evaluation regarding important issues. Finally, it was found that of negative exploitation and offensive and discriminatory representation of isolated cases or the mere exhibition of exotic or uncommon aspects regarding the minority group are not uncommon in both entertainment and information programmes.

According to the organisations represented in the workshop, the Mass Media have to respect the constitutional and legal principles of the democratic state: the respect for the dignity of the human person, the respect for the rights, liberties and guaranties of the citizens and the equality of all persons independently of their ethnicity, belief or social origin. Therefore, it should not be accepted when the Mass Media, in order to increase their audiences, compromise on quality of information, and on the general principles set out by the law. Finally, the High Authority pointed out that the mass media have special responsibility in the field of education, in the promotion and incentive of values that allow and motivate the full exercise of citizenship (Pereira and Nogueira, 1998: 233-235). The High Authority for the Mass Media has not received any specific cases of negative or prejudiced/biased reporting in the area of racism.

#### *4.12.3.4 LEGAL INSTRUMENTS AGAINST RACISM*

Law number 115 of 3 August 1999 introduced the legal recognition of immigrant associations as well as the technical and financial State support for the development of their activities. The High Commissioner gives this recognition for Immigrants and Ethnic Minorities to those associations that wish to be recognised as such, as long as they fulfil the appropriate conditions foreseen in the Law. These recognised associations may have the following rights: to participate in the definition of the immigrants policies; to participate in the legislative processes concerning immigration; to partic-

ipate in the consultative bodies, in the terms defined by the law; to benefit from the *right to public speech on the radio and television*. Since the introduction of the law, already 25 immigrant associations have been legally recognised. The associations can be of national, regional or local scope, according to the number of members each association claims to have: that is, the number of associated members will determine if an association can be considered as being of local, regional or national range.

An anti-discrimination Law was published on 28 August 1999. It prohibits discriminatory practices based on 'race', colour, nationality and ethnic origin. Article I states that the objective of this law is to prevent and prohibit racial discrimination in all its forms and sanction all acts that violate a person's basic rights or impede the exercise of economic, social or cultural rights for reasons such as nationality, colour, 'race' or ethnic origin. This Law also provides for an Advisory Committee for Equality and Against Racial Discrimination. Presided by the High Commissioner for Immigrants and Ethnic Minorities, the Committee is responsible for promoting studies on equality and racial discrimination, supervising enforcement of the law, and making legislative proposals considered suitable for the prevention of all forms of discrimination (Baganha, Marques and Fonseca, 2000: 36).

The law number 20, of 6 July 1996, introduced the possibility for immigrants, anti-racist and human rights associations to assist in a legal action against discrimination, together with the victim and the Prosecution, i.e. to formulate an accusation and to introduce evidence into the penal process. The individuals or organisations may constitute as a civil part in a penal process except in the cases of clear opposition of the victim, whether or not s/he has requested her/his constitution as assistant. This applies to crimes motivated by discriminatory attitudes based on 'race' or nationality, and especially to crimes foreseen in the Penal Code.<sup>109 110</sup> The constitution of assistant as it is proposed in the law is free from payment to the

---

109 Reviewed by law number 65 of 2 September 1988.

110 Articles 132, n. 2 line d - qualified murdered instigated by racial, religious or political hate; article 146<sup>o</sup> - Offence to qualified physical integrity; art. 240<sup>o</sup> - Racial or Religious Discrimination.

court. The changes in the Penal Code included the reference *to national or religious origin as well as the denial of crimes of war or against peace and humanity* such as the denial of the Holocaust and Nazi crimes.

#### 4.12.3.5 PROGRAMMES

In Portuguese Television there are no specific programmes aiming at immigrants and/or ethnic minorities. Nevertheless, a recent programme in 2000 had as a *resident guest* a Roma origin young university student for an approximate period of six months. This programme has a talk show format (*formato de conversa de café*) and is weekly transmitted, in the second channel of the Portuguese Public Television Service. The programme is called '*Travessa do Cotovelo*' and its objective is to discuss in an informal way (around a *coffee-shop table*) certain pertinent and actual themes. In two of the programmes two specific themes were discussed regarding immigration and the Portuguese Roma community. These programmes discussed the issue of integration and the problems that these communities face.

#### 4.12.3.6 MONITORING MEDIA

The High Authority for Mass Media

The High Authority for the Mass Media (Alta Autoridade para a Comunicação Social) is a regulatory body that aims to safeguard the right to information, the freedom of the press, the independence of the mass media, the fair and balanced reporting of the information, freedom of speech, and to guarantee the exercise of the right to public speech and to political response.

The Office of the High Commissioner for Immigrants and Ethnic Minorities

The office of the High Commissioner for Immigrants and Ethnic Minorities disposes of a large archive of empirical documentation available for public consultation. This includes a collection of press clippings from 1996 until the present day, i.e. a database of the news published in the written press regarding immigrants and eth-

nic minorities in Portugal. Simultaneously, the HCIEM Office also disposes of a video archive on relevant programmes regarding the issue of immigration and racism from 1996 until the present day.

#### 4.12.4 CONCLUDING REMARKS

In the last ten years, Portugal, as a new country of immigration, has been witnessing the growing importance of all the issues related to the phenomena of racism and xenophobia. Although scientific research is starting to be produced more, *the area of immigration and the mass media still lacks information and research.*

The existing research indicates that Portuguese media are not free from stereotypical representations. An interesting and typical feature is the positive complicity expressed and the accepted similarities between Africans and Portuguese as well as the absence of assumed and declared racist attitudes.

The reported studies found that the press articles seldom refer and identify the anonymous citizen, the Africans, the immigrants and the ethnic minorities, particularly when reporting on positive references. The pictures also prime for the absence of these groups, while journalists mainly follow the dictates of reaching audience rates, and the temptation of the most popular discourses often stand as a barrier to the implementation of ethical and deontological codes on the part of the journalists. They often tend to sensationalism, emphasising the negative aspects of these communities, resorting to routine reporting which requires least time and effort. This behaviour leads the journalist to misuse and distort information (Cunha, 1996; Gonçalves, 2000; Castanheira, 1996).

Nevertheless, existing research has also made visible the role played by the mass media in the reproduction of discourses of anti-racism, particularly when the press is dominated by some specific thematization, such is the case regarding the European Year Against Racism. In this case, the issue of racism even deserved being commented by specialists in the different analysed newspapers (Da Costa, Valente, 1998). This positive role can also be trans-

mitted through advertisement campaigns aiming the fight against racism and the promotion of tolerance.

After having discussed the existing research, it can be concluded that it would be extremely important to develop new research in this area. The data and information available at the HCIEM may prove to be very useful in a future possible research project regarding the role of the mass media in the social construction of behaviours, attitudes and values towards immigrants and ethnic minorities in the Portuguese society.

#### 4.12.5 REFERENCES

- ACIME (Alto Comissário para a Imigração e Minorias Étnicas) (1997). *Relatório do Ano Europeu Contra o Racismo (Report on the European Year Against Racism)*, Lisboa, ACIME, 1997.
- ACIME (2000a) *Boletim Informativo do Alto Comissário para a Imigração e Minorias Étnicas*, n. 42 (HCIEM Newsletter 42), Lisboa, ACIME, Abril de 2000
- ACIME (2000b) *Minutes of First Portuguese Round Table on Racism and Xenophobia*, Lisbon, May 2000 (unpublished).
- Baganha, M. I., Marques, J.C., and Fonseca, G. (2000). *Is an Ethclass Emerging in Europe? The Portuguese Case*. Lisboa, Luso - American Development Foundation, July 2000.
- Boletim Informativo do Alto Comissário para a Imigração e Minorias Étnicas*, n. 42 (HCIEM Newsletter 42) Lisboa, ACIME, Abril 2000: 6-9.
- Castanheira, J. P. (1996). "Comunicação Social" ("Mass Media"); Paper presented at the workshop *Concrete and Innovative Attitudes Towards Tolerance In Educação para a Tolerância*, Actas da Conferência (Education for Tolerance - Minutes of the Conference, Secretariado Coordenador dos Programas de Educação Multicultural, Ministério da Educação, Lisboa, Fevereiro de 1996.
- Cunha, I. F. (1996). *Os Africanos na Imprensa em Portugal: 1993-1995 (The Africans in the Portuguese Press: 1993-1995)*. Lisboa, Centro de Documentação Amílcar Cabral - CIDAC, Novembro de 1996.
- da Costa Valente, A. (1998). *1997, Ano Europeu Contra o Racismo na Imprensa Escrita em Portugal: Análise do Público e Jornal de Notícias (1997, European Year Against Racism and the Written Press in*

- Portugal: The Analysis of Público e Jornal de Notícias). Lisboa, ISCTE, June 1998 (unpublished).
- do Céu Esteves, M. (Ed.) (1991). Portugal, País de Imigração (Portugal, Country of Immigration), Lisboa, Instituto de Estudos para o Desenvolvimento, Caderno 22, 1991: 6-8.
- Franqueira, A. (1996). "Portugal, País de Brandos Costumes - A Atitude e os Valores dos Portugueses face aos Imigrantes e às Minorias Étnicas". (Portugal, Country of Gentle Habits - The Attitudes and the Values of the Portuguese Concerning Immigrants and Ethnic Minorities). Coimbra, September 1996. (Unpublished manuscript).
- Garcia, J. L. (Ed.) (2000). Portugal Migrante - Emigrantes e Imigrados, Dois Estudos Introdutórios (Migrant Portugal - Emigrants and Immigrants, Two Introductory Studies) Oeiras, Celta Editora, Dezembro de 2000:53-56.
- Gonçalves, B. (2000). "Os Média e o Racismo" ("The Media and Racism"), Paper presented at the Workshop Media and Racism, In First Portuguese Round Table on Racism and Xenophobia, May 2000 (unpublished).
- Instituto Nacional de Estatística (2000). Estatísticas Demográficas 1999 (1999 Demographic Statistics) Instituto Nacional de Estatística, Lisboa, 2000.
- Leitão, J. (1999). National and Local Dimensions of Immigrants Integration Policies - The Portuguese Case, Public Speech presented at International and Local Migration Politics Seminar, Lisbon, September 1999 (unpublished).
- Leitão, J. (2000). Portugal and its Interethnic Future, Public Speech presented at the International Metropolis Workshop, Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Washington, 2000 (unpublished).
- Machado, L. F. (2000). Os Novos Nomes do Racismo: Especificação ou Inflação Conceptual (The New Names of Racism: Specificity or Conceptual Inflation), Sociologia n.º 33, CIES, Oeiras, Celta Editora, Setembro de 2000.
- Marques, M. M. and Santos, R. (1999). Preface, In Portes, A. (Ed.), Migrações Internacionais. Origens, Tipos e Modos de Incorporação (International Migration: Origins, Types and Ways of Incorporation), Oeiras, Celta Editora.
- Pena Pires, R. (1991). A Opinião Pública Face aos Estrangeiros" (Public Opinion Towards Foreigners), In do Céu Esteves, M. (Org.) Portugal,

- País de Imigração (Portugal, Country of Immigration), Lisboa, Instituto de Estudos para o Desenvolvimento, Caderno 22, 63-74.
- Pereira, A. G. and Nogueira, V. (1998). A Comunicação Social e os Direitos das Minorias (The Mass Media and the Rights of the Minorities). In Forum para a Comunicação Social (Forum for the Mass Media), Alta Autoridade para a Comunicação Social, Lisboa, Julho de 1998.
- Portes, A. (1999). Migrações Internacionais. Origens, Tipos e Modos de Incorporação, Oeiras, Celta Editora
- Secretariado Coordenador dos Programas de Educação Multicultural (1996). Educação para a Tolerância, Actas da Conferência (Education for Tolerance - Minutes of the Conference, Secretariado Coordenador dos Programas de Educação Multicultural, Ministério da Educação, Lisboa, Fevereiro de 1996.
- Serviço de Estrangeiros e Fronteiras (2000). Que Imigração no Novo Milénio? (What Immigration in New Millennium?), MAI, SEF, Divisão de Planeamento, Lisboa, Novembro de 2000
- Vala, J., Brito, R. and Lopes, D. (1999). Expressões dos Racismos em Portugal (Expressions of Racisms in Portugal), Lisboa, Instituto de Ciências Sociais.