

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES  
(E.D.I. Ltd)**

**ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACT OF EC SUPPORT TO THE  
ROAD TRANSPORT SECTOR IN TANZANIA**

**RESPONSES FROM FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION  
REHABILITATION OF THE MWANZA ROAD NETWORK  
8ACP TA 010 & 8 ACP ROR 003**

**AUGUST, 2005**

## **1. Introduction**

### **1.1 Purpose of the Focus Group Discussion (FGD)**

The Focus Group Discussion was held in order to investigate the changes and impacts resulting from EC support to the TANROADS in the rehabilitation of the Mwanza road network.

The objective of the project was to improve the conditions for economic activity and development in Mwanza by rehabilitating the Mwanza road network. The main activities included i) rehabilitation of the airport and Mwanza-Nyanguge roads, Kenyatta road and nine urban roads, ii) upgrading to gravel standard of the Usagara-Kisesa bypass and finally iii) technical Assistance to the Mwanza municipality.

### **1.2 Participants**

The Focus group included various beneficiaries of the road rehabilitation project in Mwanza Region including representatives of<sup>1</sup>:

- Haulage operators
- Public Transport providers
- Farmers and Fishermen
- Large Scale Industry
- Health Service Providers
- Road Safety Officers
- Local Government

### **1.3 Date and Location**

The focus group discussion was held on 25<sup>th</sup> August 2005 in Mwanza city, the regional capital of Mwanza Region.

### **1.4 Structure of Focus Group Discussion**

Participants were divided into three groups each representing different types of stakeholder:

Group 1 consisted of representatives of haulage, public transport and large-scale industries.

Group 2 included representatives of the Mwanza City Council, NSAs and health service providers.

Group 3 represented smallholder farmers, fishermen and the local community (civil society).

---

<sup>1</sup> A full list of participants is provided in the Annex of this report

Six discussion areas were presented to participants during the day. Some of these were targeted at specific stakeholder groups (as indicated below) whilst others were presented to all groups.

1. **GENERAL CHANGE** (all groups): The focus group discussions began with a general question about change. Participants were asked to individually identify all changes (positive and negative) that they have seen in the past five years that have resulted from the EC supported project. Participants were also asked to identify specific changes that have occurred in the road network including roads that have benefited from rehabilitation and other important roads that were not included in the project.
2. **LARGE SCALE TRANSPORTATION** (Group 1): Representatives of Public transport and haulage providers together with representatives from large scale industry were identified as “heavy road users”. This group was asked to discuss the changes (positive and negative) that have occurred for large scale transporters in terms of vehicle running costs, travel time and costs and service provision clients/customers (quality and quantity).
3. **BASIC SERVICES - HEALTH AND EDUCATION** (Group 2): Representatives of local government, health services providers and non-state actors were asked to discuss the changes that have been seen in terms of access to and availability of health and education services as a result of this project.
4. **ECONOMIC CHANGES/MARKET CONDITIONS** (Group 3): Small scale farmers and fishermen and representatives of civil society were asked to discuss changes that have been seen in terms of economic change and market conditions in terms of access to and from markets, employment, changes in costs and transport time, changes in producer farm gate prices and level of sales, farmers’ income and livelihood related changes.
5. **MITIGATION OF NEGATIVE FACTORS** (all groups): Construction and rehabilitation of roads has certain negatives impacts associated such as road safety, dust/pollution, environmental degradation and HIV/AIDS. All groups were asked to discuss what changes have occurred as a result of this project in terms of negative impacts and minimisation thereof.
6. **PARTICIPATION AND CROSS-CUTTING ISSUES** (all groups): Groups were asked to discuss the level of involvement of the community in project planning and to what extent the cross-cutting

issues of gender, environment and sustainability have been integrated into project implementation.

At the end of the discussions a representative of each group presented the groups consensus to all participants. To ensure maximum participation of participants the workshop was conducted in Kiswahili. The outcomes of each discussion were transcribed and then translated into English. The English language transcription of the main responses is included as an annex.

The following sections present a summary of each discussion area including rankings of each area of change/impact and key discussion points.

## 2. Summary of Individual-Level Change

Participants identified changes in terms of benefits, problems and roads not included in the project. Identified benefits and problems are presented below in tabular form followed by a summary of the main changes.

### o Benefits

The benefits identified by participants are presented in the table below:

Benefits	No. of Participant Responses	Percentage Score
Reduced Cost of Travel/vehicle running costs	16	26.7
Reduced level of Dust/Cleaner City	11	18.3
Reduced Traveling Time/Increased Access	6	10.0
Increased Trade	5	8.3
Increased Access to Markets	4	6.7
Increased/Improved Public Transport	3	5.0
Increased distance of paved roads	3	5.0
Increased Mobility of Service providers (police, fire)	2	3.3
Increased Tourism	2	3.3
Reduced traffic congestion	2	3.3
Increased Access to Basic Services	1	1.7
Ease of transporting fragile goods	1	1.7
Increased number of vehicles	1	1.7
Project funded by grant not a loan	1	1.7
Increased Availability of goods in rural areas	1	1.7
Reduction in Crime	1	1.7
Total Number of Responses	60	100.0

The most frequently quoted benefit from the project was the reduced cost of travelling both in terms of reduced vehicle running costs and resulting reduced cost of public transport. For example one respondent previously replaced shocks, bushels and springs in his car twice a month now the same parts need replacing after 4 months. Another responded estimated that fuel consumption of cars on the roads prior to the project was about 4 Km per litre of fuel and now it is around 7Km per litre, implying a reduction in fuel costs of almost 50%. Costs of public transport including minibuses and taxis have also decreased. For example a taxi from Mwanza to Nyamanoro used to cost 6,000 TShs but now costs only 2,000 TShs. A minibus from Mwanza city to Kisesa used to cost 1,000 TShs and now costs 500 TShs.

Another commonly identified benefit was the reduction in the levels of dust pollution and the resulting cleanliness of the city. This benefit has resulted in a reduction coughing caused by dust and increased cleanliness of buildings and gardens. One participant commented that previously he would leave home

clean but arrive at work in dusty or muddy clothes, now he is able to reach work without dirtying his clothes. Aside from the reduction in dust participants also noticed that litter was being collected more frequently and that less people were littering the streets.

The project has reduced travel time along the rehabilitated routes, for example, Mwanza to Magu used to take more than 2 hours now the trip is only 1 hour long and the journey from Mwanza to Musoma has been reduced by 1.5 hours.

The higher quality road network has also promoted trade in the city with more people willing to do business there and business activities have become easier as result of increased access to/from and within the city. Small scale producers such as farmers and fishermen have benefited from increased access from rural communities to the markets of Mwanza city.

○ **Problems**

Aside from the benefits identified a number of problems or areas for further change were identified.

Problems	No. of Participant Responses	Percentage Score
Increase in road traffic accidents	9	45
Reduction in trade for pushcart operators, mechanics and part suppliers	3	15
Poor design of some drainage systems	2	10
Demolition of houses near new road	1	5
Increased incident of car theft	1	5
Increased Pollution from engine emissions	1	5
Increased migration to the city	1	5
Slow project implementation	1	5
Damage to new roads by increases in heavy traffic	1	5
Total Number of Responses	20	100

The most frequently identified problem resulting from the project has been the increase in road traffic accidents which it was suggested have increased by 100% since 2002. Participants felt that the interventions to ensure road safety have been insufficient and further action should be taken.

Another negative impact has been the reduction in trade for mechanics and spare parts suppliers which has resulted from the increased quality of the roads and thus the reduced need for vehicle repair. Respondents also noted that some of the drainage systems built beside the new roads had been poorly designed which has resulted in flooding of the drains and damage to the roads.

- **Further roads requiring rehabilitation:**

Participants highlighted a number of roads that had not been included in the EC supported project. Participants recommendations are listed in the annex of this document. It should be noted that many participants suggested roads for rehabilitation were identified for two main reasons:

- **By-passing the city centre:**

Roads that allow traffic to by-pass the city centre and therefore reduce traffic congestion included the Usagara – Kisesa road which links Musoma to Shinyanga and the Pasiona Road that links Musoma to the airport.

- **Increasing Access to/from economically productive areas:**

Examples included the Kamanga – Sengerema road for example is the shortest route to Geita which is home to large gold mines and areas closer by which are active in fishing and farming. The Airport – Igombe – Kayenze road connects Mwanza city and its fish processing plants to the fishing communities of Igombe.

### **3. Large Scale Transportation**

Representatives of public transport, haulage providers and the large scale industry were asked about changes that have occurred in large scale transportation

#### **Vehicle Running Costs**

As a result of the higher quality roads the costs of running vehicles has decreased. For example fuel consumption of a car has improved from 3 Km per litre before the project to 6-7 Km per litre after the project.

Similarly vehicle maintenance and servicing costs have also decreased.

#### **Client and Customer Benefits**

Users of public transport have benefited from a more comfortable journey, improved vehicles as providers are now more willing to buy new vehicles and decreased travel cost and time. Examples given include:

- Taxi fare from Mwanza City to Nyamanoro has decreased from 6,000 TShs to 2,000 TShs
- Travel time from Nyaguge to the city has decreased from 2 hours to 45 minutes
- Bus fare from Mwanza to Kisesa has decreased from 1,000 to 500 TShs.
- Travel time from Mwanza to Magu has decreased from over 2 hours to 1 hour.
- Travel time from Nyegezi to town has declined from 45 minutes to 15 minutes.

Similarly haulage clients have benefited from decreased travel time and costs and an increase in the number of haulage operators and vehicles. One respondent highlighted benefits to firms who have to transport fragile goods such as bottles, with high quality roads free of pot holes this participants is now able to transport his goods with minimal breakages compared to the past.

#### **Service Provision**

As a result of the road works there has been a significant increase in the number of taxis, mini buses and large buses. It was noted that this increase in the number of vehicles is benefiting the Government through increased tax revenue from vehicle import duties.

#### **Negative Changes**

Some businesses however have not benefited from the road improvements such as operators hand carts and old worn-out vehicles who are no longer able to compete with the new service providers.

#### **4. Basic Services**

City council representatives, health service providers and non-state actors were asked to discuss the changes in provision of basic services (health and education) to the local communities.

##### **Access**

As noted above there has been an increase in the number of buses, taxis and private cars enabling an increased number of people to travel more easily. Furthermore as a result of the decreased vehicle running costs and increased competition travel costs have declined, for example, before the project a taxi to Bugando Medical Centre (BMC) from the city centre was TShs 3,000 – 5,000 now it is TShs 1,000. Before the project there were no minibuses to the hospital now there are with a fare of TShs 200.

The improved roads have also decreased travel time, for example, now it takes 10-15 minutes to travel by car from Sekou Toure hospital to BMC before it took 20-30 minutes (in both instances assuming no traffic congestion).

##### **Rural communities**

Road improvements have improved the accessibility of some formally remote rural areas which has made delivery of health and educational services to these communities easier. The communities of Buhongwa, Mkolani, Igoma, Bugogwa and Butimba were quoted as examples.

##### **Usage Basic Services**

There has been an increase in the number of rural patients visiting the city to seek basic services. The number of students from rural communities now travelling to and from the city daily for secondary school has increased to the extent that Pamba and Mwanza secondary schools have both added two sessions of morning and evening school to accommodate these additional rural students.

##### **Health Visitors and Mobile Clinics**

Health workers are now able to make more frequent visits to rural areas in order to deliver services such as vaccinations, maternal and child health care (MCH).

##### **Access of government and NSA to rural communities**

Similarly, the reduced travel time and costs have enabled government and non-government workers to access the rural community more frequently. For example, the city officials' visits to dispensaries, health centres, schools, ward and village offices have increased. NSAs including Plan International, TANESA,

AMREF, ACORD, KIVULINI, TAHEA, PRIDE, FINCA, CARTAS have been able to expand their services to more communities.

### **Other Services**

The improved transport network has also enabled other service providers to move around the city and surrounding areas much more easily. For example, one participant noted that police officers are now able to reach crime scenes much more quickly. Similarly fire fighters and refuge collectors can now reach a wider area.

## **5. Economic Change**

Small scale farmers and fishermen together with representatives of civil society were asked to discuss changes in the economic situation of local communities.

Participants noted that in general they had benefited from globalisation and more free business environment in Tanzania. They had also benefited from increased access to credit, media and information. In relation to the EC supported project they had benefited from a higher quality road network which has made travel and transportation much easier.

### **Market conditions**

The local market conditions for small scale farmers and fishermen's produce had improved. Benefits identified included increased availability of agricultural inputs and equipment, however some prices have risen as a result of the decline in value of the Tanzanian shilling on the currency markets and the increase in oil prices.

### **Benefits to Civil Society**

The decrease in transport costs and time has resulted in an increase in the availability and a decrease in the price (by 40-60%) of basic food stuffs. As a result of decreased travel costs and time the income of many people has increased. Peoples lives have also improved as a result of an increase in access to school, hospitals, water, transportation and high education institutions.

### **Employment Opportunities**

Participants agreed that there has been an increase in employment opportunities as result of the project particularly during project implementation when many local people were hired to assist in road construction. The increase in transport service provision and trade is also likely to have resulted in increased employment.

## **6. Mitigation of Negative Impacts**

### **Road Safety**

Whilst there have been many benefits resulting from the rehabilitated road network a negative impact has been a significant increase in speeding which has resulted in a large increase in road traffic accidents. One respondent suggested that road accidents have increased two fold since 2002 and that the majority of these accidents have involved cars hitting pedestrians and cyclists. Participants felt that the plans and strategies to reduce road accidents have been inadequate.

Participants proposed that further actions was required including an increase in speed bumps, traffic signs and traffic lights. Driver education in road safety was also proposed.

### **Dust**

Since the majority of rehabilitation work in Mwanza included the asphaltting of roads the overall project has resulted in a significant decrease in the levels of dust in the city. Participants identified a number of benefit resulting from this change including:

- Less health problems relating dust pollution
- Improved cleanliness of the city and people homes.
- Improved personal cleanliness. Previously participants would leave home clean but would arrive at work with dusty or muddy clothes.

### **HIV/AIDS**

The project did not include any activities related to HIV/AIDS. Furthermore, one group commented that there a number of road workers had fathered children whilst working in Mwanza.. After the completion of the project these men had left Mwanza leaving the mother and child behind.

## **7. Participation and Cross-cutting issues**

### **Community and Gender Participation**

The local community did not participate at all in the planning of the project. The only area of participation in the project identified was in the direct and in direct employment of local people during road rehabilitation. Direct employment includes people who were employed by TANROADS and contractors, where as indirect employment includes those vendors near areas of construction who benefited from increased trade from construction workers. Some women were employed in construction work however no data was available to measure this.

### **Sustainability**

It was felt that the community should have been more involved to ensure the sustainability of the project. Further investment in construction plant equipment is needed to continue the maintenance of the new roads. Mwanza City Council does have a technical advisor who us preparing a city development plan and capacity building programme which will assist in project sustainability.

### **Environment protection**

The increase in the volume of traffic has resulted in an increase in pollution from engine emissions. Rehabilitation/construction of roads included the construction of improved drainage canals which have prevented soil erosion. Also some community based organisations (CBOs) have been given the task of cleaning the drainage canals and roads. However, drainage canals on the Kenyatta road continue to flood.

## **ANNEX**

The focus group discussions were conducted and transcribed in Kiswahili. The following is an English translation of the responses presented by participants after each discussion question.

### **o Individual-level changes**

Individual-level changes were presented by individuals without discussion with other participants. The statements below are presented as the participants wrote them on a paper. Each participant identified changes which have occurred to him/her in the past five years as a result of the EC supported project.

### **Participant No. 1**

Changes brought about by the improvements of Mwanza Roads

Benefits:

- Areas are more accessible
- Fares have decreased e.g. the Taxi fare from Mwanza city to Nyamanoro used to be more than Tshs 6,000 now it is only Tshs 2,000
- No more coughing due to dust which was the case before the roads were paved
- Vehicle operating costs have declined (fuel, wear & tear)
- The city looks cleaner
- Other services such as hospital services, fire fighting services and the like are delivered more effectively
- More tourists are visiting Mwanza city
- Access from agricultural/fishing areas to markets has been improved and helping the businesses of farmers and fishermen

Problems:

- There is an increase in road accidents (no data but the truth remains there)
- Demolition of houses all along the route (road reserve)

Important roads that were not included in the project:

- Kamanga – Sengerema road

This is the closest road to Sengerema Geita and other potential areas for agriculture, fishing and mining. Also it is the shortest route to these areas.

- Airport – Igombe – Kayenze road

This road connects Mwanza city to the big fishing centres of Igombe. The fish processing factories in Mwanza are being supplied by fish from this area.

- Bondeni road

The road is important for attracting investors

## **Participant No. 2**

### *Benefits:*

- Reduced levels of dust which used to affect people's health
- As a city, Mwanza has developed in the trade sector, as it has attracted more traders to the city. All this has happened because transportation of commodities from the city to other regions has been made easier.
- Road improvements have made Mwanza city more attractive to Tanzanians living in other regions as well as tourists
- Before the road improvements transport was a big problem, particularly amongst workers, for example public transport (*daladala*) was rare, but there has been large increase in public transport services.

### *Problems:*

- An increase in road accidents

### *Suggestions:*

- There should be more road safety signs (traffic lights) to avoid accidents
- Roads beyond the city for example Mwanza – Geita should be improved because this is where there is large businesses and due to the poor road quality some traders are deterred from doing business there.

## **Participant No. 3**

Road related changes which have occurred in the past five years.

### *Benefits:*

- Travelling times have decreased
- Costs (fare) have been reduced
- Communication in trading has increased
- Vehicle running costs have declined

### *Problems:*

- Road accidents have increased as a result of speeding

#### **Participant No. 4**

##### *Benefits:*

- Ease of reaching the place my home, travel time has become much shorter
- Lower fuel consumption
- Dust has decreased substantially in Mwanza city – You can leave home clean and arrive in the office or in town still clean
- Houses and gardens look cleaner because of reduced dust. One does not need to paint his house as frequently as in the past
- You can be sure of transporting your commodities like bottles (delicate items) safely without breakage
- Springs and other car spare parts last longer than they used to, for example I used to install new springs in my car every 3-4 weeks, but now once I do, I forget, as they do not get broken again
- The number of cars have increased
- Security situation has improved – the police can reach crime scenes quicker

##### *Problems:*

- Road accidents have increased to large extent
- Pushcart business has been affected
- Cases of cars theft have increased, whereas there were very few in the past
- Traders involved in car spare parts have less business
- Car mechanics have less works to do

##### *Important roads which have been left out:*

- Mwanza – Bariadi

Bariadi district produces a lot of crops such as maize, chick peas, cotton, and livestock products.

- Mwanza – Busami (Magu district)

Many villages along this road produces crops like cotton, chick peas, maize, sorghum and are involved in traditional livestock keeping. Places like Dulasi and Mwamjala villages have good very good land that when local people are sure of selling whatever they produce can cultivate

- Main road (Shinyanga) – Misasi

Potential in vegetables production and livestock keeping

- All roads of Isamilo

## **Participant No. 5**

In the past the roads were very bad, had potholes and were not easily passable. However after construction:

### *Benefits:*

- Travel time - in travelling within the city now travel time from one point to another has been reduced by 60% (on average). For example, from Nyaguge to the city centre instead of 2 hours as we used to now it takes 45 minutes
- Commodity transport - transportation of farm produce from rural areas has been made easier. An indication for this is reduced price following a decline in transport costs
- Fuel consumption - fuel consumption has relatively declined, instead of 4 km/l for a car it has improved to an average of 7km/l
- Vehicle maintenance costs - these costs have declined tremendously. For example, instead of replacing bushes, shockups and springs twice a month as we used to do, now they last for up to 4 months. Also, servicing which was then done monthly because of dust, now is done after an average of 2 months
- General cleanliness – Cleanliness of the city has highly improved. There is no dust, the buildings are clean. Debris easily moved out of the city, people are doing away from the bad habit of throwing debris everywhere

### *Problems:*

- Road accidents have increased because of the increased speed of driving

### *Important roads which have been left out:*

- Butimba

The road leads to institutions – TTC, Magereza, Fishery Institute (Chuo cha Uvuvi)

- Pansiasi – Buzuruga

The road joins Musoma and Airport road without crossing the city centre (could reduce traffic congestion)

- Usagara – Kisesa

The road links Musoma and Shinyanga road without crossing the city centre especially for heavy trucks

- Breweries road

The road serves an area which is highly settled and to the beer factory

- Kijiji road –Kiloleni – Buzuruga

## **Participant No. 6**

### *Benefits:*

- Increase in the network of paved roads (58 KM)
- Reduced town transport problems (more public transport mini-buses 'daladala')
- Increased beauty and view of the city
- Declining costs of transport/running vehicles
- Transport fares are not increasing unnecessarily
- Increase in roadside trading premises particularly along major roads of Kenyata, Nyerere, Airport/Makongoro and Uhuru (shops are open)
- Decrease in personal cleanliness costs as the roads are free of mud and dusts (shop owners are no longer experiencing the dirtying of their commodities from dust and mud)
- Decline in dirty and debris in the city because of easiness of cleaning the roads and shyness felt by people to litter the good roads

### *Problems:*

- Increase in road accidents particularly in Airport/Makongoro and Nyerere roads where pedestrians and bicycle riders are mainly hit by cars
- Increased difficulty of cleaning the drainage canals because the concrete coverings are heavier to lift (150 mm thickness)

### *Important roads which have been left out:*

- Pasiansi – Buzuruga

To reduce the traffic congestion in the city centre

- Usagara – Kisesa

To reduce traffic congestion in the city centre particularly along Kenyata road

- Nyerere Rd/Pamba Jct – Isamilo – Kiloleni

To reduce traffic congestion along Makongoro road and to improve transport services to people living in Isamilo, Mjimwema, Kilimahewa, Kiloleni, Nyansaka, Lumala

## **Participant No. 7**

### *Positives:*

- Lower VOC (vehicle operating costs)
  - Less fuel per km
  - Less spare parts/tyres

Reduced travel time

Reduce cargo delay costs

- Better access for more people to health centres, schools and social activities
- More economic activities
- Money for construction is grant money, not loan

*Negatives:*

- Increased pollution due to growth in traffic
- Deadly accidents doubled between 2002 and 2004
- More migration to towns
- Implementation of EDF programs is slow due to red tape on both sides (Gov/EC)

*New connections to be constructed:*

- The road from Mwanza township to by-pass Usagara – Kisesa and new industrial areas to be developed along new by-pass. Also new link from airport to Kisesa.

## **Participant No. 8**

*Conditions of road in Mwanza:*

- We appreciate the work done on the roads in city centre and the main road from city to other towns – Shinyanga, Musoma. Some streets in the city have still to be rehabilitated
- Rehabilitation of the roads has benefited us by reducing motor vehicle operating expenses as regards to spares and travel time.

*Roads not included in the project:*

- Roads in Sengerema district – Buchisa area in particular have not been considered. The bad condition of the roads hinders fast delivery of fishery and crops to the markets in Mwanza, Sengerema and Shinyanga.
- Future road rehabilitation as far as fish industry is concerned – roads to major landing cites e.g. Kayenze, Igombe, Nassa, Sengerema, Geita etc where fish delivery trucks go, should be passable the whole year

## **Participant No. 9**

*Benefits:*

- Easier accessibility for:
  - Goods – commodities/agriculture
  - Public – easier access to urban centres
- Transporters

Less wear and tear (tyres/parts (10%))

Less fuel consumption (5 – 10%)

Rates have become competitive

- Travel time MZA – Musoma – has decreased by 1.5 hrs after MZA – Nyaguge road has been rehabilitated
- Increase in business vice versa urban/rural

*Problems:*

- Due to use of roads by heavy trucks in city the roads are damaged
- Road maintenance – regular drainage cleaning will be necessary to sustain the new roads
- Pamba road and Lumumba street have been damaged due to poor drainage design

*Suggestions:*

- City should invest in equipment to keep the roads clean
- Strict laws to ensure side walks are not used for parking of heavy vehicles

*Important roads that have been left out of the project*

- New contracts given only if the design of road (e.g. drainage) is good
- Kisesa - Usagara road to reduce pressure on city roads
- Resurfacing Nyanguge – Musoma road
- Mwanza - Geita Road priority due to presence of mines, fish, agriculture – maize, cotton
- The road from Chato - Muleba does not have enough traffic should have come after MZA – Geita
- Kiloleni road
- Road in front of Mwanza hotel

**Participant No. 10**

*Benefits:*

- Fare and travel time:
  - The bus fare from Mwanza town to Kisesa was Tshs 1,000 now it is Tshs 500
  - The fare charged for public transport involving mini-buses *daladala* from town centre to Igoma was Tshs 250 now it is only Tshs 200
  - Travel time from Mwanza to Magu was more than 2 hours now it is 1 hour
  - Inconveniences to passengers and congestion has ended in the roads of Airport – town, Igoma – town, town – Buhongwa – Nyegezi (travel efficiency)

- Security
  - Decreased congestion of people has caused appreciable drop in theft practices (pick pocketing)

*Problems:*

- Improvement in road quality has increased incidences of road accidents particularly in Airport – town, Mwanza – Musoma, Mwanza – Shinyanga roads. Because the road improvements have resulted into more road accidents, education to drivers and road users should continually be provided.

*Important roads which have been left out:*

- Posta road, Nkurumah road, Pamba road, Lumumba road in the city centre and Station road.
- District roads – Kamanga road to Sengerema which provides a linkage to farmers, Usagara road to Geita which is also important for farmers to bring their crops to the city, and Kisesa road to Sumve hospital.

**Participant No. 11**

*Benefits:*

- Roads are easily passable
- The rate of purchasing spare parts has decreased
- Travel time from one place to another has decreased. For example from travelling by car from Nyegezi to own was 45 minutes now it is 15 minutes
- Sweeping and collection of debris has improved, this is because those who are supposed to do the job are doing it better
- Drainage canals can be easily cleaned, this is because it was well built no water remain stagnant
- Reduced traffic congestion of cars compared to when the roads had potholes

*Problems:*

- Frequent road accidents, for example
  - People are hit frequently
  - Accidents involving vehicle accidents – cars, motorbikes, bicycles, pushcarts or wheelbarrows
- Spare parts dealers do not get customers as frequently

*Important roads which have been left out:*

- Posta, Pamba, and Station roads
- Usagara – Busisi road– in order to facilitate farmers to bring their crops
- Kisesa – Sumve road– to ease transport of farmers' produce to town

## **2.2 Results from group discussions**

### **2.2.1 Group No. 1**

As explained earlier, Group 1 included stakeholders involved in haulage, public transport and large scale industry. The group discussed the changes to large scale transportation as well as mitigation of negative impacts, participation and cross cutting issues.

#### ***Vehicle maintenance/running cost***

- Car fuel consumption has declined to 6/7 km/litre from 3/km/litre before road construction
- Maintenance costs in terms of spare parts, tyres have decreased (bushes, springs, shocks etc)

#### ***Clients/passengers/customers benefits***

- Passengers travel happily (conformability)
- Operators have brought better buses/mini-buses/taxis
- Haulage/public transport services have become faster
- By having more transport vehicles, fare has decreased (competition)

#### ***How has the project affected the level of services available to clients?***

- Taxis have increased
- Mini-buses have increased
- Good buses have increased
- Private cars have increased

#### ***Other (Positive and negative) changes resulting from the road rehabilitation***

Positive

- The government gets an income as many people are importing cars
- People/traders are investing

Negatives

- Increase in accidents

- Some people have missed the business, for example pushcarts, operators of worn-out cars (taxi, mini-buses)

### ***Cross-cutting issues***

#### Community participation

- The community was not involved in the project planning

#### Participation of women

- Women did not participate

#### Sustainability (maintenance)

- More equipment are required
- Further funding is required
- The MCC has a TA who is developing the city development programme and capacity building

#### Environment protection

- It has enabled to have the gardens
- Drainage canals have been improved
- Kenyatta road drainage canals are flooded with water

### **2.2.2 Group No. 2**

As explained earlier, Group 2 included stakeholders involved from the local government (city council) departments, NSAs, and health service providers. The group discussed the changes to provision and access to basic social services as well as mitigation of negative impacts, participation and cross cutting issues.

### ***Changes in travel time and costs in relation to accessibility to health and education facilities***

After roads improvement/construction:

- There has been an increase in the number of cars
- Business competition has caused a decline in the costs transport, for example before improvement of roads taxi charge to Bugando Medical Centre (BMC) was Tshs 3,000 – 5,000 now it is Tshs 1,000. Furthermore, there was no public transport (*daladala*) now it is there with a fare of Tshs 200
- After the roads have been improved/constructed travel time has decrease, for example now it takes 10-15 minutes to travel by car from Sekou Toure hospital to BMC (if there is no congestion of cars), before it took 20-30 minutes (if there was no car congestion)

***Have health and education services become more available in rural communities?***

- There were places which were not easily accessible before road improvement now they are easily accessible
- Delivery/provision of health and education services in rural areas has been made easier
- People from those areas (rural and sub-urban) are easily travelling to town to get health and education services, for example people from Buhongwa, Mkolani, Igoma, Bugogwa, Butimba etc

***How has usage of basic health and education services changed?***

After roads improvement:

- There has been an increase of rural patients coming in town to seek services
- Number of students from rural areas who come school in town and go back home daily has increased, Pamba and Mwanza secondary schools have added two sessions of morning and evening school in order to accommodate an increase of rural students

***Are health workers visiting rural communities more often?***

- YES, now health workers pay frequent visits to rural communities to deliver services like vaccination, maternal and child health care (MCH), and debris collectors

***How has the level of access of government and NSA agencies to rural communities changed?***

- The extent of government and non-government workers to access the rural community has changed greatly. For example, the visits city officials to the dispensaries, health centres, schools, ward and village offices have increased tremendously. Local government officials visits rural communities more often. Also, organizations have increased and expanded their reach after the roads have been constructed, such organizations include Plan International, TANESA, AMREF, ACORD, KIVULINI, TAHEA, PRIDE, FINCA, CARTAS etc

***Cross-cutting issues***

Community participation

- People have been employed in the project which helped them alleviate poverty
- Improvement of community income, for example women and men food vendors '*mama lishe*' and '*baba lishe*' earned an income

Participation of women

- Some women were employed in the project
- Women who were involved in selling bananas, fish, food etc earned an income

### Sustainability (maintenance)

- Community should be involved for it to realize it owns the road project and so conserve the roads

### Environment protection

- Construction of these roads has helped an installation of improved drainage canals hence reducing soil erosion which was degrading the environment. Also, there are CBOs given the mandate of cleaning the drainage canals including sweeping the road and desilting the canals

### **2.2.3 Group No. 3**

As explained earlier, Group 3 constituted stakeholders involved in from small scale agriculture, fishermen and civil society. The group discussed the changes to their economic situation as well as mitigation of negative impacts, participation and cross cutting issues.

#### ***Economic changes (2000-2005)***

The economy has grown because of:

- Ease of travel and transport because of the quality roads
- Institutions which provide credit have increased
- Globalisation/free business
- Increase of media institutions and information provision

#### ***Market conditions (2000 – 2005)***

The market situation is good because of:

- Quality of roads, for example vegetables are easily available. Prices of agricultural produce has declined by 40 – 66%
- Availability of implements and inputs

They are easily available

Costs have hiked/increased because decline of the value of our shilling in the world market and increase of oil price

#### ***Income situation (2000 – 2005)***

- Incomes have increased because of improvement in transportation services
- Livelihoods have changed/improved because of an increase of important social services like school, hospitals, water, roads, high learning institutions

### **Employment Opportunities**

- There has been an increase in employment because of the quality roads

### **Mitigation of Negative Impacts**

The project has resulted in the following negative impacts:

- Increase in road accidents
- Plans/strategies to reduce road accidents have been inadequate. No education on how to reduce the accidents
- Pushcart/wheelbarrow business has declined
- Siltation of waste water canals
- Presence of children who have no fathers, the fathers were employees of road project who later left

### ***Dust***

- Dust has decreased

### ***HIV/AIDS***

- There was no education on HIV/AIDS offered in relation to the effects of road project

### **Cross-cutting issues**

#### **Community participation**

- The local community were not involved in the planning of road construction

#### **Participation of women**

- Very few women were involved in road construction

#### **Sustainability**

- Sustainability was not addressed by this group

#### **Environment protection**

There has been some environmental degradation as a result of road construction:

- Waste water canals have become silted
- Gravel borrow pits have been left unfilled
- Increased traffic has resulted increased environmental pollution from engine emissions and also the lack of toilets (cars are used as bushes/toilet shields which people hide behind to go to the toilet).

ANNEX  
List of Participants

S/N	Name	Organisation
1	Ben Gerritsa	Mwanza City Council Transport Department
2	Thobias P Bujiko	Mwanza City Council City Engineer
3	Lwelenja Ferainand	Mwanza City Council Agriculture Department
4	David J Robi	Mwanza City Council Health Dept
5	Venance Kezilahabi	Mwanza City Council Health Dept
6	Hezeline Chawachi	IHEP
7	Manjit Sandh	TBS
8	Joseph Maduloro	Mwanza City Council
9	C Luhenyula	Regional Council
10	J. Q Kassese	Nile Perch Fisheries
11	Susanna Makoye	MbogaMboga Village
12	Edda Biswaro	MbogaMboga Village
13	Masegenghe Mathais	Ward Executive Office
14	Annah Lupemba	Prime Fuels Ltd

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES  
(E.D.I. Ltd)**

**ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACT OF EC SUPPORT TO THE  
ROAD TRANSPORT SECTOR IN TANZANIA**

**RESPONSES FROM FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION  
RUVUMA AND SOUTHERN IRINGA ROAD MAINTENANCE PROJECT (RUSIRM)  
(7 ACP TA 95 AND 96)**

**SEPTEMBER, 2005**

## **1. Introduction**

### **1.1 Purpose of the Focus Group Discussion (FGD)**

The Focus Group Discussion was held in order to investigate the changes and impacts resulting from EC support to TANROADS in the rehabilitation of the core road networks of Ruvuma and Southern Iringa regions.

The overall objective of the project was to promote economic growth and better living conditions in the programme area, by bringing about a sustainable improvement in the condition of transport infrastructure. The purpose of the programme is to reduce transport costs and improve general accessibility within the programme area. The main results of the programme were expected to be that the highest priority basic road network in the two regions will be restored to a good maintainable condition and an organizational framework to maintain it in that condition will be firmly established.

### **1.2 Participants**

The Focus group included various beneficiaries of the road rehabilitation project in Ruvuma Region including representatives<sup>1</sup> of:

- Haulage operators
- Public Transport providers
- Small-holder Farmers
- Large Scale Industry
- Health Service Providers
- Police Traffic Officers
- Non-State Actors
- Regional Government
- Local Government (Songea Municipality)
- SACCOS

### **1.3 Date and Location**

The focus group discussion was held on 1<sup>st</sup> September 2005 in Songea Town, the regional capital of Ruvuma Region.

### **1.4 Structure of Focus Group Discussion**

Participants were divided into three groups each representing different types of stakeholder:

Group 1 consisted of representatives of haulage, public transport and traffic police.

Group 2 included representatives of Local and Regional Government and health service providers.

Group 3 represented smallholder farmers, NSAs, SACCOS, farmers' cooperatives and the local community (civil society).

Seven discussion areas were presented to participants during the day. Some of these were targeted at specific stakeholder groups (as indicated below) whilst others were presented to all groups.

1. **GENERAL CHANGE** (all participants): The focus group discussions began with a general question about change. Participants were asked to individually identify all changes (positive and negative) that they have seen in the past five years that have resulted from the EC supported project.
2. **CHANGES IN THE ROAD NETWORK** (all groups): Participants were also asked to identify specific changes that have occurred in the road network including roads that have benefited from rehabilitation and other important roads that were not included in the project.
3. **LARGE SCALE TRANSPORTATION** (Group 1): Representatives of Public transport and haulage providers together with representatives from large scale industry were identified as "heavy road users". This group was asked to discuss the changes (positive and negative) that have occurred for large scale transporters in terms of vehicle running costs, travel time and costs and service provision clients/customers (quality and quantity).
4. **BASIC SERVICES - HEALTH AND EDUCATION** (Group 2): Representatives of local government, health services providers and non-state actors were asked to discuss the changes that have been seen in terms of access to and availability of health and education services as a result of this project.
5. **ECONOMIC CHANGES/MARKET CONDITIONS** (Group 3): Small scale farmers and fishermen and representatives of civil society were asked to discuss changes that have been seen in terms of economic change and market conditions in terms of access to and from markets, employment,

---

<sup>1</sup> A full list of participants is provided in the Annex of this report.

changes in costs and transport time, changes in producer farm gate prices and level of sales, farmers' income and livelihood related changes.

6. MITIGATION OF NEGATIVE FACTORS (all groups): Construction and rehabilitation of roads has certain negatives impacts associated such as road safety, dust/pollution, environmental degradation and HIV/AIDS. All groups were asked to discuss what changes have occurred as a result of this project in terms of negative impacts and minimisation thereof.
  
7. PARTICIPATION AND CROSS-CUTTING ISSUES (all groups): Groups were asked to discuss the level of involvement of the community in project planning and to what extent the cross-cutting issues of gender, environment and sustainability have been integrated into project implementation.

At the end of the discussions a representative of each group presented the groups consensus to all participants. To ensure maximum participation of participants the workshop was conducted in Kiswahili. The outcomes of each discussion were transcribed and then translated into English. The English language transcription of the main responses is included as an annex.

The following sections present a summary of each discussion area including rankings of each area of change/impact and key discussion points.

## 2. Summary of Individual-Level Change

Participants identified changes in terms of benefits, problems and roads not included in the project.

Identified benefits and problems are presented below in tabular form followed by a summary of the main changes.

### o Benefits

The benefits identified by participants are presented in the table below:

Benefits	No. of Participant Responses	Percentage Score
Reduced Traveling Time/Increased Access	15	18.1
Reduced Cost of Travel/vehicle running costs	12	14.5
Increased Access to/from Markets	10	12.0
Increased Number of Vehicles	7	8.4
More Roads are passable all year round	7	8.4
Increased/Improved Public Transport	5	6.0
Increased Access to Basic Services	5	6.0
Improved availability/price of goods in rural areas	3	3.6
Increased employment opportunities	3	3.6
Increased Mobility of Service providers (police, fire)	2	2.4
Increased Access to Information and Communications	2	2.4
Increased Local government access to rural communities	2	2.4
Increased Trade/Business	1	1.2
Increased distance/quality of paved roads	1	1.2
Increased Quality of produce (Increased competition)	1	1.2
Increased Access to Business Services (SACCOS	1	1.2
Increased Income of Farmers	1	1.2
Reduced Dust	1	1.2
Reduction in Road Traffic Accidents	1	1.2
Improved opportunities for women	1	1.2
Reduction in Traffic offenses	1	1.2
Improved Drainage	1	1.2
<b>Total Number of Responses</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>100.0</b>

The major benefits identified by participants included:

- o Reduction of travel time and the resulting increased access to and from rural areas. For example, the journey from Songea town to Tunduru used to take 11-14 hours now the same trip takes only 8 hours. Travel from Songea town to Namtumbo used to take 3 hours now the journey is only 1 hour. Respondents also identified a reduction in waiting time for public transport now that more services are running.
- o Reduction in the cost of transport and in vehicle running costs was also frequently quoted. The improvements have resulted in a significant decline in the number of vehicle

breakdowns and subsequent maintenance costs as has vehicle fuel consumption. A large bus from Songea to Tunduru used to consume 350 litres of fuel for a round trip, the same journey now uses 250 litres.

Fares for public transport have also declined for example travel from Songea to Tunduru used to cost 15,000 TShs and now costs 9,000 TShs.

- Access to and from markets for rural farmers. The improved roads to and from rural communities has significantly improved the ability of farmers to transport their goods to the market and also encouraged buyers to go direct to rural communities to buy goods. The improved access has also allowed for improved distribution of agricultural inputs to rural farmers.
- The road rehabilitations have resulted in an increase in the number of people and businesses buying cars.
- The rural communities also benefited from the rehabilitation of the road networks as roads that were formerly only passable in the dry season are now passable all year round. Also some roads that were formerly only passable by four wheel drive vehicles can now be used by normal small cars.

Other highlighted benefits include increased availability of goods in rural communities which has included a equalisation of prices in rural and urban areas. Access to basic services resulting from improved roads and transport services has decreased the number of pregnancy related deaths as more pregnant women can now reach health services in time. There has been a notable increase in the number of public transport services available, such that passengers now experience hassle by public transport providers when they are choosing which bus to take.

- **Problems**

Aside from the benefits identified a number of problems or areas for further change were identified.

Problems	No. of Participant Responses	Percentage Score
Increase in road traffic accidents	7	43.8
Poor cleanliness of the new roads	1	6.3
Poor design of some drainage systems	1	6.3
Further investment is need in roads not included in the project	1	6.3
Increased incidence of banditry	1	6.3
Increase in disease	1	6.3
Increased migration to the town resulting in shortages of employment	1	6.3
Increased competition has resulted in shortages of produce for buyers	1	6.3

Lack of Basic services in Songea town	1	6.3
Increased activity on the black market	1	6.3
Total Number of Responses	16	100

The major concern of participants with regard to the road rehabilitation programme was the increased occurrences of speeding which have resulted in increased incidents of road traffic accidents. Though interestingly the representative of the police traffic department stated that road traffic accidents had decreased during this time frame from 336 accidents involving 69 deaths and 525 injuries in 1995. Whereas in 2004 there were 152 accidents associated with 51 deaths and 426 injuries. It was not possible to explain the difference between participants' perceptions of road traffic accident occurrence and the police figures.

### **3. Changes in the Road Network**

All groups were asked to discuss what changes that had observed in the physical road network and to identify areas where rehabilitation work was not conducted.

#### **Type of Change**

Participants identified various activities that have been a part of the rehabilitation programme which included construction of earth roads, widening of major roads, construction of bridges and the construction of culverts

#### **Users and Beneficiaries of the Road Rehabilitation**

Use of the roads has increased as a result of the project and road users were identified as businesses, local government, farmers, haulage operators and their clients, workers, students and the general community. No differentiation was made between users and beneficiaries.

#### ***Where did these changes happen?***

The main roads that were rehabilitated included the following routes:

- Songea – Mbinga – Mbambabay
- Songea – Tunduru road
- Tunduru – Masasi road
- Namtumbo – Namkecha road
- Songea – Lusewa road
- Songea – Magagula road
- Lumecha – Kitanda road

- Tunduru – Lukumbule road
- Kitai – Kindimbu juu road
- Mgazini – Kingoli road
- Magagura – Mpepayi road
- Mpitombi – Nambendo road

***Roads that were not rehabilitated:***

Participants identified a number of routes that were not rehabilitated but were consider important for future work, they included:

- Mgazini – Kingoli/Litumbanjozi road
- Magagura – Mpepayi road
- Mpitimbi – Nambendo road
- Songea – Lituhi – Mitumoni road
- Lumecha – Mahenge road
- Songea – Mbambabay – Lituhi should at least be upgraded to gravel level
- Sasawala and Magazini roads should be improved to gravel level
- Madaba - Ifinga road has to be rehabilitated
- Damaged bridges should be constructed, for example Namtumbo to Mgombasi
- Installation of drainage canals in all constructed roads
- Selection of qualified contractors for road construction
- Namtumbo- Kitanda to Morogoro road should be upgraded to gravel level in order to attract investors for example in Selou game reserve

**Results of these Changes:**

Participants identified some further benefits that resulted from the project. These benefits have been included in the relevant sections.

#### **4. Large Scale Transportation**

Representatives of public transport, haulage providers and the large scale industry were asked about changes that have occurred in large scale transportation

##### **Benefits to Large Scale Transporters**

A benefit to transporters of the improved roads has been a reduction in vehicle running costs and vehicle breakdowns. Fuel consumption for a 10 ton bus travelling from Songea to Tunduru used to be 350 litres for a round trip now it is only 250 litres. Operators now have to pay less allowances to truck workers for example transportation of cargo from Songea to Tunduru took 3 days and staff would receive allowances of TShs 40,000 per worker, but now the trip takes only one day allowances have reduced to TShs 15,000 per worker.

Maintenance costs have decreased due to less breakdowns, previously cars and trucks would not be able to make a long trip without having some maintenance problems (broken springs, flat tyres etc). As a result of improved roads one operator suggested that maintenance costs have reduced by 40 %.

##### **Benefits to clients**

Clients have benefited from reduced transportation costs and travel time in both public transport and haulage sectors. For example a journey from Namtumbo used to take 3-5 hours and is now only 1.5 hours and the fare for this journey has decreased from 3,000 TShs to 2,000 TShs. The fare from Songea to Mbamba bay was TShs 12,000 now it is TShs 7,000 and Songea to Ligela was TShs 8,000 now it is TShs 4,000 – 5,000. The journey time from Songea to Mbamba bay has also reduced from 10 hours to 7 hours. Reduced journey times for passengers has also resulted in reduced subsistence costs. For example, it was not possible in the past to make a return journey to Mbamba Bay from Songea in the same day, so travellers would have no choice but pay for accommodation and food. Now more places are accessible over night costs have been reduced for clients.

Clients of haulage companies have also benefited from reduced travel times. Previously a round trip from Songea to Tunduru took three days now the journey can be completed in just one day. The quality and quantity of transportation services have improved. Transportation companies are now acquiring newer more comfortable vehicles.

## **5. Basic Services**

Local and Regional Government representatives and health service providers were asked to discuss the changes in provision of basic services (health and education) to the local communities.

### **Access to Health Services**

The improved road network has resulted in increased access to health services, particularly for the rural population. This has resulted in a reduction of deaths of patients who had previously been unable to reach a hospital. Seven specific examples were given of the reduction in travel time to health facilities in all cases travel time had been at least halved. In three cases travel time had been reduced from 10 hours to just 3 hours (Songea to Mhukuru Health Centre, Madaba Health Centre and Lusewa Health Centres).

The reduction in fares had also improved people's ability access to health services. For example the journey from Namtumbo to Songea now costs 2,500 TShs compared to 4000 TShs, Namabengo to Songea now costs 1500 TShs compared to 2,500 TShs and Lusewa to Songea now costs 6,000 TShs compared to 10,000 TShs in the past.

Improved access to rural health services has also enabled improved distribution of supplies which used to take three months (from order to delivery) now takes one month. In the same time frame 11 new dispensaries have opened.

Access to villages by health workers has also increased which has been aided by both road improvements and provision of bicycles. The group also commented that people were more motivated to use the available health and education services and that usage had increased.

Medical institutions have also been able to improve provision of health related information such as information relating to safe child birth.

### **Access to Education**

As with health, the improved network has improved the ease of transporting supplies to schools including educational and construction materials. Also teachers are more able to travel to town to follow up their salary issues.

The increased access and reduced costs to rural schools by government officials was particularly highlighted with examples of the journeys from Songea to Kitanda primary school now takes 2 hours and costs 2,500 TShs instead of 8 hours and 4,000 TShs, Songea to Mpitimbi primary school now takes 45 minutes (900 TShs) instead of 1.5 hours (1,200 TShs) and Songea to Magagura primary school now takes 2 hours (1,500 TShs) instead of 5 hours (4,500 TShs)

**Access to Rural Communities by Government Officials and Non State Actors.**

Government officials are now able to make more frequent visits to rural areas. For example, the Regional Commissioner recently visited Magagura village to talk to the villagers which would have been difficult to accomplish in the past due to poor roads.

NSAs including SACCOS; ITI (International Trachoma Initiative and Tecnoserve organization have been able to expand services to more villages and make more frequent visits.

## **6. Economic Change**

Small scale farmers and fishermen together with representatives of civil society were asked to discuss changes in the economic situation of local communities. Discussion focussed mostly on the benefits to the agricultural sector which the participant represented.

A result of increased market access has been an increase in production levels of farmers combined with an increase in use of agricultural input. Because of increased competition farmers have also made efforts to improve the quality of their produce.

### **Access to markets**

Participants agreed that access to local, national and international markets had improved. Transportation to local and national markets (particularly Morogoro) have improved as has the cost of transport. Regionally there are now more buyers rather than just one cooperative buyer in the past creating competition for crops. Nationally small scale producers of fruit wines are now able to reach a larger market. Tobacco, coffee and paprika can now be transported more easily to Morogoro where international buyers are located.

Farmers are also now more able to visit Songea town to sell produce and to make use of facilities only available in town, such as Micro-finance institutions.

### **Crop and Input Prices**

Crop prices have increased, for example the price of maize has increased from TShs 3,000 to TShs 12,000 per bag and tobacco has increased from TShs 500 to TShs 800 per kg

The price of imported chemical fertilizer has increased from TShs 7,000 to TShs 25,000 per 50 Kg bag as a result of the devaluation of the Tanzanian Shilling on world currency markets and the increased oil price. Previously farmers would have to pay a further TShs 700 per bag to transport fertilizer from Songea to the village however as a result of improved distribution farmers can now buy fertilizer in the village.

### **Changes in farmers income and livelihoods**

Farmers are now able to take to market all of the crops they harvest and because of increased quality of crops there is competition. Increases in farmers' incomes have enabled them to build modern homes and make increased use of health and education services.

## **Employment Opportunities**

There was some disagreement over which types of employment had changed. It was felt that self-and temporary/casual employment had increased substantially. However the group representing local and regional government felt that permanent employment had increased where as the civil society group felt it had decreased. No figures were available to confirm either argument.

It was identified that in the agricultural sector more permanent positions are available as well as an increase in positions for casual labourers. Casual labour was also employed during the road rehabilitation project and for cleaning and maintenance of the new roads.

Private sector employment also appears to have increased particularly in the transportation where bus and haulage fleets have been expanded requiring additional drivers and support staff (bus conductors, vehicle loading staff etc). The increase in the number of vehicles has also resulted in more temporary employment for mechanics and car cleaners.

The training needs of new and old drivers has also resulted in increased employment in driver education, particularly driving schools.

## **Other Business Services**

Improved access to rural areas has encouraged telecommunications operators to expand their coverage of Ruvuma region, for example Buzz and Celtel now operate in Mgagura ward.

## **7. Mitigation of Negative Impacts**

### ***Dust***

Participants stated that level of dust has increased and that no action to counter this. The community has been encouraging the planting of trees to minimise dust which has been achieved in some areas.

### ***HIV/AIDS***

The increased mobility of the population was identified to have the potential to increase transmission of HIV. The project included some aspects of HIV/AIDS education for the community through workshops and meetings. HIV is now a standard agenda item at all official meetings.

### **Road Safety**

The consensus of most the participants was that there had been an increase in deaths associated with road traffic accidents, however, as stated previously the representative of the police force provided data that countered this view. An example given of road traffic related death was that of two high profile politicians in the region and a large bus accident.

Counter measures have included road safety education, speed bumps and police check points along the roads. Ruvuma region also hosted a national road safety week for two consecutive years. However it was felt that more road warning signs should be added especially near bridges.

### **Crime**

There has been an increase in banditry in the areas of Mawanga and Luhimba villages. This has resulted in buses from Songea to Njombe being given a police escort,

## **8. Participation and Cross-cutting issues**

### **Community and Gender participation**

The local community was not involved in the planning of this project. Participants stated that they were however represented by members of the road board.

Women were not involved in project planning but a number of women were employed during the project. An example given was of women in Lilondo and Lotola who are involved in road cleaning and directing traffic.

### **Sustainability**

One group felt that the project was not sustainable, however, other felts that sustainability was possible through road maintenance.

### **Environment**

Participants felt that environmental issues were not included in the project plans. Areas where environmental degradation had occurred included the clearing of trees to make a path for the roads and the dumping of litter along the road side by an increased number of road users. No counter measures were identified.

## ANNEX

The focus group discussions were conducted and transcribed in Kiswahili. The following is an English translation of the responses presented by participants after each discussion question.

### o **Individual-level changes**

Individual-level changes were presented by individuals without discussion with other participants. The statements below are presented as the participants wrote them on a paper. Each participant identified changes which have occurred to him/her in the past five years as a result of the EC supported project.

### **Participant No. 1**

#### *Benefits:*

- A decline in road traffic accidents, for example in 1995 there were 336 accidents involving 69 deaths and 525 injuries while in 2004 there were 152 accidents associated with 51 deaths and 426 injuries likewise in 2000, 2002 and 2003 there was fewer accidents and a reduction in resulting deaths, injuries and property loss
- Transport facilities/vehicles have increased (cars, motorbikes, bicycles etc) hence improved public transport
- The time passengers spend travelling has decreased, for example, a bus from Tunduru to Songea used to take 11 hours now it takes 8 hours
- Car breakdowns have decreased because the roads are good, particularly during dry season
- Car related traffic faults have declined as cars are not damaged now that the roads are good and people are buying modern cars
- Our work has been made easier as are able to travel by car to where an accident has occurred even in rural areas (Facilitator's note: Participant 1 is a police traffic officer)
- Tracing suspects after a crime has been made easier for the police officials

#### *ii) Problems:*

- Some drivers are speeding on the new roads

## **Participant No. 2**

### *Benefits:*

- Transport has become easier not that the roads are good
- Fares have declined
- No car breakdown because the roads are good
- Cars are able to reach their destination on time because the roads are good. For example, from Tunduru to Songea was very bad road in the past such that when the car left Tunduru at 6.00 am in the morning it would not reach Songea until 8.00 pm (14 hours), now if a car leaves Tunduru at 6.00 am it reaches Songea by 2.00 pm (8 hours) because the road is now good

### *Problems:*

- Road traffic accidents have increased. Because of the quality of the road, cars can drive very fast such that a driver can reach Songea before 2.00 pm in the afternoon

## **Participant No. 3**

### *Benefits:*

- Transport services have been made easier, for example travel time for both public and cargo cars has decreased
- There are more cars than in the past
- Road communication is good
- Cars breakdown less frequently now
- Cars now consume less fuel than in the past
- Travel time been shortened compared to the past, for example travelling from Namtumbo to Songea now takes 1 hour compared to the 3 hours that it used to take

## **Participant No. 4**

### *Benefits:*

- Now, small cars like saloons can travel from Songea to Namtumbo
- Farmers' produce is now transported more easily, for example tobacco from Mgombasi (Namtumbo) or Matimiwa (Songea) is transported by trucks which can reach the villages because the roads are good
- Buses can now offer public transport services throughout the year in the following areas: 1) Songea – Hanga – Mputa – Kitanda, 2) Songea – Magagura, 3) Songea – Mkongo – Lusewa, 4) Lusewa – Magazini – Likusanguse. These roads were very bad in the past but now are passable

- Also transport services between Songea – Namtumbo to Tunduru used to stop during rainy season. This year it is the first time we had transport services throughout the year
- Bus fares have decreased

Problems:

- In general there are no negative changes. However, education on usage of roads could be taught because now the speed of cars in those roads has increased especially in the Songea – Namtumbo and Lumecha – Msindo – Hanga roads.

### **Participant No. 5**

Benefits

- Travel time from one destination to the other has decreased
- People have been motivated to buy private transport facilities (motorbikes and cars)
- Health service to patients have become easier as serious patients can be rushed to the hospital
- People have been motivated to run projects/business as is now easier to procure commodities from different parts
- Commodity prices in urban and rural are now not much different
- People/youth have got employment
- Many roads are passable throughout during dry and rainy season

### **Participant No. 6**

Benefits:

- Construction/rehabilitation of roads particularly the case of drainage canals has helped roads to last longer

Problems:

- For the roads which have been constructed the drainage canals have been damaged (deepened) they have survived shorter time

### **Participant No. 7**

Benefits:

- Songea town is big, smallholder farmers can now come to Songea to join SACCOS as the road is now good
- Business wise, particularly transport facilities such as bicycles, motorbikes, cars even pushcarts have improved

Problems:

- Because the roads are good some of drivers drive cars/motorbikes too fast hence causing accidents

### **Participant No. 8**

Benefits:

- Travelling from here to Dar es salaam takes less time and it is cheaper also a person does not get tired
- Travelling from Songea municipality to a new district of Namtumbo is easier and you can even go and come back twice in a day
- Women have benefited a lot as travelling into villages for example to Matimira to procure tradable produce like bananas, maize has become easier, now even when it is raining people still procure commodities without getting stuck in the road.
- The number of cars has increased
- Breakdown of cars has become less frequent

Problems:

- As a result of roads being good drivers are driving too fast for example the mini-buses which go to Namtumbo are driven very fast
- There is more cars than passengers as a result passengers get harassed by operators when they scramble for customers

### **Participant No. 9**

*Benefits:*

- It has been easier for farmers to bring their produce to the market – market accessibility
- Private buyers go directly into villages
- Input distribution by private companies – Songea – Namtumbo has improved
- Smallholder farmers can easily access social services in town
- More people have come to town to seek employment
- Farmers' produce can easily be transported to Morogoro (Songea – Iringa road)
- Competition has increased because of quality improvement of commodities
- Increased availability of commodities in villages and petty business
- Access to information and communication has improved

Problems:

- Shortage of labour as more people migrate to town to seek work
- Competition in raw materials for example the tobacco factory in Songea can not procure enough tobacco as there is more buyers coming from Morogoro
- Lack of basic health services, the government should provide health services to urban residents
- Presence of diseases in the community and fast changes of the environment
- Increased black market practices which have affected availability of commodities and caused price hikes

### **Participant No. 10**

Benefits:

- Transport services are readily available instead of waiting a long time for a car
- Cleanliness of the environment (there was a forest now it is clear)
- Employment creation (like cleaning the roads and drainage canals)
- Traders are coming to villages instead of following them in town

### **Participant No. 11**

Benefits:

- Due to the good roads, transport services have become faster
- The improved roads have caused an improvement in governance as high level officials are visiting rural areas more often as the roads are passable throughout the year
- Fares have decreased because the number of cars have increased and travel time has decreased
- In terms of governance roads have made communication between the village and district leadership easier
- Roads have brought rural development as farmers can easily sell their produce at a good price and hence improve their livelihood and ultimately bring about national development in general
- Prices of commodities have been reduced and transportation costs lowered because the roads are good
- Agriculture production has increased due to increased access to market, traders are now going into villages such as Kizuka and Mgagura

### **Participant No. 12**

Good changes:

- Deaths of pregnant mothers has been drastically lowered as pregnant mothers unlikely to deliver safely are rushed to the health centres with experts such as Howiso, Peramiho
- Equipment/working gears like medicines, kerosene, gas containers, and supervision are delivered/done within timeframe if it has to be done within a month is formerly it used to take three months to have these things done
- Availability of various health information from health centres have increased by 95% likewise dissemination of information to health centres. This information covers epidemics and contagious diseases like cholera, meningitis, yellow fever, plague, dysentery etc

Problems:

- The issue of cleanliness along these roads is not given emphasis

### **Participant No. 13**

*Benefits:*

- Within the period of five years since the road improvements have been done, there is some advantages particularly for roads in Songea rural – from Songea to Tunduru used to take us three to four days to transport the cargo therefore clients did not receive their commodities when they expected. But in this period clients get their commodities within required time
- Also it has helped us to have a good schedule in our transport arrangement and we can plan for things like fuel consumption
- Now transportation frequencies have increased in the past I used to have my car travelling thrice a month now it is four times a month, however there are some portions of the road which are still difficult

### **Participant No. 14**

Benefits:

- Roads which were passable with difficulty are now are easily passable throughout all seasons (all weather)
- Roads which had damaged culverts, the culverts have been installed to the quality such that when cars are passing over these culverts you experience no fear
- Another benefit is that travelling has become easier, journeys are not as long as when the roads were bad travelling was difficult. But now when you are travelling you know you are going to arrive to where you are travelling in a particular time to and coming back on a particular time also
- Transportation of crops from the farm areas to the market is easier

Problems:

- Drivers have been driving too fast because the roads are now easily passable this makes them drive faster in order to cover more routes and earn more out of the transportation business. This causes more road accidents

Suggestion:

- We have our roads further improved, and drivers are to be educated through seminars

### **Participant No. 15**

#### Benefits:

- In general, the number of cars has increased
- Transport services in some villages have improved for example travelling between:
  - Magagura – Songea
  - Mgazini – Peramiho
  - Mahukuru – Songea
  - Namatuhi – Songea
  - Mpitimbi – Songea
  - Matimira – Songea
  - Mgombasi, Nambecha etc – Songea
- Travelling between Tunduru – Songea, travel time has decreased, likewise Mbinga – Songea, Mbambabay – Songea
- Transportation farm produce and other commodities from rural villages to Songea has increased, production has increased as well
- Patients get to hospital easily, communication in general has improved

#### Problems:

- Increase in road accidents
- Increase in banditry

#### Request:

- Although the project has phased out there are other important roads which were left out, for example 1) Kilagana (Songea) – Litumbandyosi (Mbinga) this road has a dead end because of lack of a bridge and it is bad, 2) Kizuka (Songea) – Mpepai Kauna No. 1 (Mbinga) residents of there are cut-off socially and economically

#### **Participant No. 16**

##### Benefits

- Rural roads are easily passable, and the government has excellently supervised construction of these roads. Before the road were constructed the situation was worst for both cargo and passengers transportation.
- Transport has become better
- Roads are passable especially rural roads which were impassable before
- People/community are doing business with confidence of transporting farm produce from the villages to town

- Costs of commodity transportation have decreased they are different from that before roads improvement the situation
- People used to lack transport services which caused death of pregnant women and children before the roads were improved
- Before, transport costs were high

Request:

- On the other side we are requesting more improvement up to the level of tarmac for rural roads

- **Results from group discussions**

The following are the results of the group's discussion in the format that the groups presented them.

- **Group No. 1**

As explained earlier, Group 1 included stakeholders involved in haulage, public transport and large scale industry. The group discussed the changes to large scale transportation as well as changes in the road network, mitigation of negative impacts, participation and cross cutting issues.

### **Changes in the road network**

#### ***Type of changes***

- Construction of earth roads
- Some roads have been expanded in width E.g. Songea – Mbinga road
- Bridges have been constructed/widened
- Travelling has been made easier, faster and safer for example Songea - Tunduru before the road was constructed travelling time was 14 hours now it is only 8 hours
- Business has improved this means income of farmers and traders has improved following a decrease in transportation costs and the economy has grown
- Commodity prices have decreased
- Users of these roads have increased
- Vehicle running costs have decreased as cars breakdowns are less frequent
- Road accidents have declined, deaths and property loss have decreased accordingly
- Transport costs have decreased, for example the fare from Songea – Tunduru was TShs 15,000 now it is TShs 9,000
- Increase in employment given by contractors

#### ***Where did these changes happen?***

- The road from Songea – Mbinga – Mbambabay
- Songea – Tunduru road
- Tunduru – Masasi road
- Namtumbo – Namkecha road
- Songea – Lusewa road
- Songea – Magagula road
- Lumecha – Kitanda road

- Tunduru – Lukumbule road
- Kitai – Kindimbu juu road

***Road users***

- Business people
- Farmers
- Workers

***Community/groups which benefit***

- Business people
- Farmers

***Nature of benefits***

- Cheaper costs of transportation
- Reduced travel time
- Reduced vehicle running costs

***In our opinions the important roads were:***

- Songea – Tunduru
- Songea – Mbambabay
- Songea – Mitomani
- Namtumbo – Mahenge
- Songea - Njombe

***Changes related to improvement of road network (in-depth assessment)***

- Vehicle running costs have decreased.
  - Fuel consumption has decreased, for example a 10 ton bus travelling from Songea to Tunduru used to consume 350 litres for a to and from trip now it uses 250 litres for a round trip,
  - Costs paid as allowances to truck workers have decreased, for example transportation of cargo from Songea to Tunduru took 3 days and we had to night allowances to workers (TShs 40,000 per worker), but because it now takes only one day (round trip) and we are paying an allowance of TShs 15,000 per worker

- Maintenance costs have decreased due to a lower frequency of breakdowns, in general, it was not easier for a car to make a round trip without having the broken springs and flat tyres, and other breakdowns. Comparatively, this time a car can travel for three days without having springs broken or flat tyres. Thus we estimate that vehicle running and maintenance costs have decreased by 40% and vehicles deterioration (wear-out rate) have decreased.

#### ***Passengers/other users of transport facilities (in-depth assessment)***

- The first benefit is a decrease in fares, for example from Songea to Mbamba bay was TShs 12,000 now it is TShs 7,000 despite of hiking the oil price; Songea – Tunduru was TShs 15,000 and now it is TShs 9,000; Songea – Ligela the fare was TShs 8,000 now it is TShs 4,000 – 5,000
- Other costs that have been lowered include accommodation and food costs, for example it was impossible to travel from Songea – Mbamba bay and come back now it is possible, this has ebbed away accommodation and food costs, these costs have decreased by 35%
- Travel time has been reduced, for example travel time from Songea – Tunduru has decreased for six hours. For Mbamba bay - Songea the travel time has decreased to 7 hours from 10 hours, thus travel time has decreased by 30%.

#### ***Improvement in the quality of services***

- Quality of services has improved because in the past there was no luxurious cars from Songea – Tunduru and now these cars are travelling the route much faster.

#### ***Benefits of road network (in-depth assessment)***

- Cheaper transport costs
- Shorter travel time
- Benefits to the people from contractors' activities
- Commodities are reaching consumers within appropriate time at cheaper prices

#### ***Problems of road network (in-depth assessment)***

- Mixing of people is high hence encouraging spread of HIV/AIDS and other crimes because of having more visitors
- Dust has increased hence causing diseases for those living close to the roads due to high speed of passing cars

### ***Employment***

- Employment has increased, for example the increase in the number of cars has increased employment for drivers and conductors hence increasing permanent employment
- Farmers have employment by engaging in farming now they are sure of transporting their produce to the markets with crops like tomatoes, fruits and vegetables
- Temporary employment has also increased for example mechanics who are required to attend more vehicles, and car cleaners
- Employment loaders and off-loaders of cargo have increased
- The number of casual labourers involved in clearing the roadsides of grasses and bushes has increased
- Casual labourers were employed by the road contractors

### ***Typology of employment and training needs***

- People employed to operate vehicles such as drivers and conductors
- Road contractors' incomes have increased and new employments have been created
- Yes, training needs have emerged because of the new employments for example driving schools like VETA and Central diocese

### ***Problems of road network***

- Road safety has been affected due to speeding drivers.
- Measures that have been taken are as follows- 1) Training of drivers particularly during the "use the road safely" week, 2) Traffic police take measures against those who violate road safety rules, 3) However, in some places of the new roads there are no road signs to alert on things like bridges etc

### ***Dust***

- The problem of dust has increased and there is no any measure taken to redress it

### ***HIV/AIDS***

- Mixing of people has increased rendering higher possibilities of HIV transmission
- Measures that have been taken is to educate the community on the disease

## **Cross-cutting issues**

### ***Community participation***

- We were involved through road board representatives

### ***Gender participation***

- Women were involved in road construction (some were employed)

### ***Sustainability***

- The issue of sustainability of the roads is now taken care of through road maintenance but for the future we are not certain

### ***Environment***

- Environment degradation exists particularly as during road construction trees were cut down, there is a need to allocate fund to restore the trees
- Throwing of litter along the roads has increase due to an increase in the number of travellers

- **Group No. 2**

As explained earlier, Group 2 included stakeholders involved from the local and regional government departments and health service providers. The group discussed the changes to provision and access to basic social services as well as mitigation of negative impacts, participation and cross cutting issues.

## **Changes related to road network**

### **Benefits to the Health sector**

- Decrease of deaths as patients from villages can be rushed to municipal hospital and Peramiho, the villages include Lusewa, Madaba, Namtumbo, Namabengo etc
- Information exchange has further improved
- Delivery of equipment to health centre has become easier and the distribution time has decreased from three months to one month, examples of health centres are Ifinga, Namabengo etc
- Cases of safe birth delivery have increased because of good communication for instance between Mtyangimbole and Songea urban

## **Agriculture**

- Improvement in the distribution of inputs, livestock, farm produce, forestry products; and manufactured commodities to rural areas, such commodities include construction materials (iron sheets, cement) and home assets like mattresses etc
- Increase in the number of farmers coming to town for various activities and traders going into villages as well
- Increase in the production of major crops and garden crops like vegetables

## **Problems**

- Littering has increased enormously along those roads
- Absence of a committee charged with road construction/rehabilitation (*participatory committee involving various stakeholders – technocrats and the local communities*)
- Environmental degradation has increased, for example people are felling trees for charcoal making or as fuel wood (these products are easily transported for sale in town) areas affected include Mtyangambole, Hangangadinda etc

## **Benefits in general**

- Increased production
- Increased important services
- Promotion of development
- Increase in employment
- Business turnover period has been made shorter
- Promotion various services

## **Users/beneficiaries**

- Business people
- Farmers
- Students
- The community in general

## **Impacts of roads on education sector**

- Educational equipment (training and construction) are more easily transported these include books, cement, iron sheet under MEMM (PEDP) and MESS (SEDP)

- It has been made easier for workers to come to town such as follow-up for the salaries. Workers use shorter time to come and go back in the past they used to spend a night in town, these workers are from rural places like Wilima, and Wino etc

### **Impacts of roads in rural areas (villages)**

- People are using less time to travel from place to place, for example from Namtumbo to Songea used to take 3 hours now it takes 1.5 hours
- Reduced fares
- Increase of transport facilities like bicycles, motorbikes, and cars
- Communication has been improved hence attracting investors, for example in Mgagura ward mobile phone companies (Buzz and Celtel) have started business

### **Suggestions**

- Important roads include for improvement:
  - Mgazini – Kingoli/Litumbanjozi road
  - Magagura – Mpepayi road
  - Mpitimbi – Nambendo road

### **Changes related to the road network (in-depth assessment)**

#### **Health**

##### ***Benefits***

- Deaths have decreased because there is more transport facilities to take patients from rural areas to health centres and Songea hospital, the health centres include Madaba, Namtumbo, and Lusewa
- Communication has improved
- Distribution of equipment has improved. In the past used to take 3 months now it takes less than a month

##### ***Problems***

- Enormous increase in litter along the roadside

##### ***Suggestions***

- There should be technical committee to look for cleanliness of the roads and other matters

## **Agriculture**

### ***Benefits***

- Efficiency in distribution of inputs, transportation of 1 bag of fertilizer from Songea to Myogo was TShs 700, now farmers are buying fertilizer right in the village
- Farmers could easily transport their produce to the markets
- Off-farm products such as charcoal are also transported easily

### **Problems**

- Increase in environmental degradation practices such as excessive tree cutting for charcoal and fuel wood particularly in rural places of Mtyangimbole, Hanga, and Ngadunda

### **Impacts of roads in rural areas (villages)**

- People are travelling the same destinations in less time, for example travelling from Songea to Namtumbo used to take 5 hours now it takes 1 – 1.5 hours only
- Fares has decreased: for example Namtumbo Songea the fare was TShs 3,000 but now it is TShs 2,000
- Number of vehicles has increased, also there is more competition
- Communication has been improved, for example Buzz has opened up business in Namtumbo (Magagura) because of the road, Celtel in Lopokela because of improvement of Songea – Mbinga road
- Promotion of rural development, for example the electrification project in Chipole has been accomplished because of the easiness in transporting the materials
- Roads have improved business and various services in rural areas of Namabengo, Naikesi, Magagura, and Mtyangimbole

### **Main users of the roads**

- Business people
- Farmers
- Students
- The general community

### **Important roads**

- Mgazini – Kingoli road
- Magagura – Mpepayi road

- Mpitombi – Nambendo road
- Important roads which have been left out by the project include Songea – Lituhi – Mitumoni (potential for crop production), Lumecha – Mahenge (potential for crop production also).

## **Changes in travel time**

### **Health centres**

#### ***Namtumbo***

- Songea to Namtumbo health centre now it takes 1.30 hours instead of 5 hours before the road was improved

#### ***Namabengo***

- Songea – Namabengo health centre now it takes half an hour instead of 1 hour before the road was improved

#### ***Mkongo***

- Songea – Mkongo health centre now it takes 45 minutes instead of 1.30 hours before the road was improved

#### ***Lusewa***

- Songea – Lusewa health centre now it takes 3 hours instead of 10 hours before the road was improved

#### ***Mhukuru***

- Songea – Mhukuru health centre now it takes 3 hours instead of 10 hour before the road was improved

#### ***Mputa***

- Songea – Mputa health centre now it takes half an hour instead of 1 hour before the road was improved

#### ***Songea - Madaba***

- Songea – Madaba health centre now it takes 3 hours instead of 10 hours before the road was improved

## **Changes on cots of travel**

- Songea – Namtumbo – the fare now is TShs 2,500 instead of TShs 4,000
- Songea – Namabengo – the fare now is TShs 1,500 instead of TShs 2,500
- Songea – Lusewa – the fare now is TShs 6,000 instead of TShs 10,000

## **Primary schools**

### ***Travel time***

- Songea – Kitanda primary school now takes 2 hours instead of 8 hours
- Songea – Mpitimbi primary school now takes 45 minutes instead of 1.30 hours
- Songea – Magagura primary school now takes 2 hours instead of 5 hours

### ***Travel costs***

- Songea – Kitanda primary school now the fare is TShs 2,500 instead of TShs 4,000 before
- Songea – Mpitimbi primary school now the fare is TShs 900 instead of TShs 1,200 before
- Songea – Magagura primary school now the fare is TShs 1,500 instead of TShs 4,500 before

## **Access to health and education services**

### ***Health***

- Health services have increased in 11 dispensaries within 5 years, these include Mtakanini, Saluti, Liula, Mlilayoyo, Mbimbi, Mkongotema, Mwanamonga, Ruhimba, Mkongo, Nakawale, Amani, Lutukira

### ***Education***

- Education services in schools have improved in schools like Nambaramo (Namabengo), Mgembambili and Mbiro (Kizuka)

## **Health officials to visit rural communities**

- The rate of health workers to visit the rural communities has increased because:
  - Rural health workers in Lipokela village were given 2 bicycles
  - Rural health workers in Namabengo village were given 2 bicycles
  - Rural health workers in Nakahengwa village were given 1 bicycle
  - Rural health workers in Magagura village were given 2 bicycles
- Evidence of health workers visiting the rural communities could be seen in the villages' visitors registers

## **Government officials/NSAs/Private sector reach to the rural community**

- Communication of government officials, NSA and private sector with rural communities has improved, for example recently the Regional Commissioner visited Magagura village to talk to the villagers in the past this was very rare because the roads were bad; SACCOS have managed to conduct meetings in Gumbiro, Magagura, Namabengo; ITI (International Trachoma Initiative) has managed to visit 20 villages in Songea district before 28/8/2005 (about a month) this was

possible because the roads are good; and Tecnoserve organization has expanded its activities in more villages such as Mpandangindo, Likalangi and Mtyangombole etc

### **Has employment (self/engaged) increased/decreased?**

Employment has INCREASED

- Permanent employment has increased in agriculture and livestock keeping
- Temporary employment involving casual labourers in roads, farms, livestock keeping, and engagement of villagers to clean roads in right in villages where the roads are passing

### ***Types of employment which have increased***

These include:

- Agriculture (crop production) and livestock keeping
- Private sector activities like hotels/tea rooms, food vending (involving men and women) etc

### ***Training***

- Training needs exist, trainings which are usually done but are still important include road safety particularly in villages of Lumecha, and Moaning where the road accidents are more often

### **Negative aspects of road network**

- Road safety has been affected due to an increase in deaths associated with road accidents, for example death of the CCM region chairman in the road accident in Little village, death of the village leader of Gardena (Hangar) also in a car accident, and death of passengers in a bus accident (Shabby company) in Igawisnga village
- Rate of banditry has increased in areas of Mawanga and Luhimba villages where there are gangs of bandits

### ***Measures taken***

- Buses travelling from Songea to Njombe are given a police escort
- Installation of speed bumps
- Police check up points along the road have increased
- Ruvuma region has been a host of the use a road safely week nationally for two times consecutively this year

### **Dust**

- Dust has increased and there is no any measure taken despite of encouraging the community to plant trees

## **HIV/AIDS**

- The disaster of HIV/AIDS has increased because of increased easiness of communication and travel.
- Measures are taken is to give HIV/AIDS related education through workshops, meetings etc. The issue of HIV/AIDS has been made an important agenda in every official meeting

## **Community participation**

- The community was not involved in the project planning

## **Gender participation**

- Women were not involved

## **Sustainability**

- The project is not sustainable

## **Environment**

- The agenda of environment was not part of the project plans

- **Group No. 3**

As explained earlier, Group 3 constituted stakeholders involved in from small scale agriculture, fishermen and civil society. The group discussed the changes to their economic situation as well as mitigation of negative impacts, participation and cross cutting issues.

## **Typology of changes**

- Roads are passable throughout the year during dry and rainy seasons
- Culverts have been installed, for example Songea – Tunduru road we use to travel for three days now travel time is 8-10 hours
- Fare do not hike because of the badness of the road but because of oil price

## **Where did these changes happen?**

- Changes have occurred in Songea – Namtumbo – Tunduru road also Songea – Mbamba bay to Lituhi road

### **Who are users of these roads?**

- Companies involved in transportation of tobacco and coffee
- Small scale traders of crops like maize, paddy rice, beans
- Fishermen and fish traders – fishes from Lake Nyasa
- Small scale miners
- All five district councils in the region

### **Beneficiaries**

- Companies
- Business people
- Farmers and workers
- Fishermen and miners
- Students
- Various institutions such as SACCOS, SACWCCG

### **Benefits which have been accrued**

- Access to markets and competitive prices
- Easy availability of social services like health, education, transport, inputs

### **Our opinions**

- Songea – Mbamba Bay – Lituhi should at least be upgraded to gravel level
- Sasawala and Magazini roads should be improved to gravel level
- Madaba - Ifinga road has to be rehabilitated
- Damaged bridges should be reconstructed, for example Namtumbo to Mgombasi
- Installation of drainage canals in all constructed roads
- Selection of qualified contractors for road construction
- Namtumbo- Kitanda to Morogoro road should be upgraded to gravel level in order to attract investors for example in Selou game reserve

### **Economic and market changes (in-depth assessment)**

There are changes on the side of farmers like:

- Farmers are producing and selling different crops in the markets
- Production has increased
- Usage of inputs has increased

- Quality of crops has increased because of competition

### **What has brought these changes?**

- Improved communication between consumers and producers
- Good roads, for example Songea – Mbinga road has transportation of fish, dagaa (small fish), and other crops very to be easier

### **Access to markets by farmers and fishermen**

Access to market has improved

#### ***Within the region (regionally):***

- In the past within the region we had only one buyer, cooperatives but now there are more private companies and farmers' groups

#### ***Within the country (nationally):***

- There is small scale processors of wine and 'chacandu' appetizing product usually made from fruits

#### ***Outside the country (internationally):***

- Buyers of our produce such as tobacco, coffee and paprika for export markets are in Morogoro

### **Changes in price of crops, commodities and inputs**

Yes, there have been price changes

#### ***Crops***

- Price of maize has increased from TShs 3,000 to TShs 12,000 per bag
- Price of tobacco has increased from TShs 500 to TShs 800 per kg

#### ***Inputs:***

- Fertilizer price has increased from TShs 7,000 to TShs 25,000 per bag of 50 kgs

### **How have these changes improved farmer's income and livelihood?**

- Whatever he cultivates has a market
- There is price competition because of quality produce
- New crops exist, for example paprika
- Modern houses have been built

### **Motivation and ability of families to take kids to school and pay for health services**

- Families are motivated and able to take their kids to school and pay for health services for their children. Motivation in education and health has increased

### **Employment issues**

There are two types of employment, self-employment and permanent employed

- Self-employment has increased but being employed has decreased (hired employment)
- Permanent employment has decreased
- Temporary employment has increased

### **Which types of employment have increased substantially?**

- Self employment

### **Training needs**

Needs for training has emerged because of an increase in the employment opportunities in the following aspects:

- Processing (SIDO UNIDO provided training on processing)
- Women contractors
- Farmers involved in new crops like paprika – training was given by DAI PESA, also new tobacco variety (air cured) cultivated through contract farming arrangements, for example the best farmer nationally from Songea got TShs 12 million from such contract farming

### **Negative impacts of road network**

- Road safety has been affected as road accidents have increased
- Trainings on road safety issues are given

### **Dust**

- Dust has increased and no any measure has been taken to solve this problem

### **HIV/AIDS**

- Following road improvement the problem of HIV/AIDS has increased particularly in the mining and entertainment areas
- Education on HIV/AIDS is given that is be honest, or have one partner, otherwise use a condom, also fliers are used to convey the message to the community

### ***Cross-cutting issues***

#### Community participation

- The community is just receiving but it is not involved

#### Participation of women

- Women are participating for example in Lilondo and Lotola women are involved in road cleaning and to direct cars

#### Sustainability

- On the community side not, except for the government and donors

#### Environment

- Tree planting is done

ANNEX  
List of Participants

S/N	Name	Organisation
1	Mpange Skai	STC (SACCO)
2	Teopista Komba	Mtyangimbole
3	Frida Ngongi	Chiku Transporters
4	Nhrdini Ngonyani	Namabengo Village
5	Amos Mahay	Lipokela Village
6	Haule Ebl	District Health Office
7	Astrida Nchumbi	Songea SACCO
8	Rehema Nilongo	Songea SACCO
9	Christantus Komba	Sonamcu Cooperative Ltd
10	Sixta Msanga	Regional Administrative Secretary
11	Makamba D. E.	Mlilayoyo Village
12	Mohamedi Rasadu	Regional Traffic Officer
13	Willy Komba	Shabir Transport
14	George Ndunguru	District Agriculture and Livestock Office
15	Martha George	SACWCCG (Coop)
16	Maximillian Komba	Lumecha Village
17	A.I. Muhembe	Municipal Council
18	Martin Challe	Songea Urban Teachers' SACCO

# **ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES (EDI)**

## **ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACT OF EC SUPPORT TO THE AGRICULTURE SECTOR IN TANZANIA**

**REPORT No. 1  
RESPONSES FROM FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION  
EC SUPPORT TO COFFEE RESEARCH  
TANZANIA COFFEE RESEARCH INSTITUTE (TaCRI)  
7 ACP 84**

**AUGUST, 2005**

## **1. Introduction**

### **1.1 Purpose of the Focus Group Discussion (FGD)**

The Focus Group was held in order to investigate the changes and impacts resulting from EC support to the Tanzania Coffee Research Institute (TaCRI) on the coffee sector and the local community (7 ACP TA 84). The project's aim was to improve the economic situation and living standards of farmers in Kilimanjaro Region by introducing new varieties of disease resistant coffee plants and improved farming techniques.

### **1.2 Participants**

The Focus group included various actors involved in the farming of coffee in Kilimanjaro Region including<sup>1</sup>:

- Representatives of Tanzania Coffee Research Institute, TaCRI
- Small Scale Farmers
- Medium and Large Scale Farmers (E.G. Coffee Estates)
- Farmers Cooperatives (KCNU)

### **1.3 Date and Location**

The focus group discussion was held on 16<sup>th</sup> August 2005 in Moshi town, the regional capital of Kilimanjaro.

### **1.4 Structure of Focus Group Discussion**

After a brief introduction from the principal facilitator on the purpose of the discussions participants were split into three groups. Each group had five participants which enabled active participation of everyone in the group.

The discussions were split into four areas:

1. **GENERAL CHANGES:** what changes (positive and negative) had participants seen in the past five years at the level of individual, community and group? This question served as an entry of the discussions.

Participants were first asked to individually identify changes that they have personally experienced in the past five years as a result of this intervention. Then each group discussed changes that have occurred in terms of changes that have affected them as individuals, as a group and the local community.

---

<sup>1</sup> A full list of participants is included in the Annex of this document

2. **ECONOMIC CHANGES:** Groups discussed what economic/livelihood changes (positive and negative) related to EC support had been seen in the past five years. Participants considered areas such as employment opportunities, access to markets (product and factor markets), sale price of produce, income and availability of produce (supply/production).
3. **TECHNOLOGY TRANSFER, TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND CAPACITY BUILDING:** Groups discussed the benefits that farmers had received as a result technology transfer and capacity building initiatives
4. **PARTICIPATION AND CROSS-CUTTING ISSUES:** Finally participants discussed the levels of participation of the community, particularly women in the planning of the project. The cross-cutting issues of sustainability, HIV/AIDS and environment aspects of the project were also discussed.

To ensure maximum participation of participants the workshop was conducted in Kiswahili. The outcomes of each discussion were transcribed and then translated into English. The English language transcription of the main responses is included as an annex.

The following sections present a summary of each discussion area including rankings of each area of change/impact and key discussion points.

## 2. Individual-level changes

Participants were asked to individually write down all changes that they have observed in the past five years that have affected themselves personally. Identified changes have been summarised into eleven categories and are presented below<sup>2</sup>.

Area of Change	Number of Individual Responses	Percentage Score
TA/Capacity Building of farmers	15	30.0
Access to new varieties	7	14.0
Empowerment/confidence of farmers	6	12.0
Improved crop yield	4	8.0
Improved farmers income	4	8.0
Organizational Strengthening of TaCRI and other farmers groups	3	6.0
Technology Transfer	3	6.0
Lower Input Costs	3	6.0
Improved Quality	2	4.0
Gender Participation/Involvement	2	4.0
Minimization of Environmental Impact	1	2.0
Total Number of Responses	50	100.0

The most frequently mentioned change was the expansion of capacity building and technical assistance provision. This was followed by access to the new varieties of coffee. Participants also felt that project gave them new found confidence in coffee farming after years of stagnation.

Whilst participants were in general positive about the changes that had occurred some areas where further change is still needed were also identified.

Further Change Required	Number of Individual Responses	Percentage Score
Lower Input Costs	4	33.3
Low availability of seedlings	3	25.0
Coffee price to increase further	1	8.3
Representation to be further improved	1	8.3
Improved Quality	1	8.3
Poor Quality Rural Roads	1	8.3
Lack of Water for Irrigation	1	8.3
Total No. Responses	12	100.0

<sup>2</sup> A full transcription of participants' responses is included in the annex of this document.

Whilst many participants felt that the new varieties had resulted in a decrease in input costs four responses indicated that these costs could be further reduced. Another significant concern of participants was the low quantity of seedlings currently available and requesting a significant increase in production as soon as possible. Other respondents suggested that the coffee price could further increase and identified the low quality of rural roads and lack of water for irrigation as significant constraints. It was also noted that representation of farmers at national/government level could further improve.

### 3 Outcomes of Group Discussions

Each discussion group was then asked to discuss the changes they have identified that have affected themselves as individuals, as a group and as a community in order to achieve a consensus.

#### 3.1 Individual Change

Area of Change	Number of Individual Responses	Percentage Score
TA/Capacity Building	10	33.3
Increased Co-operation among farmers	4	13.3
Access to new varieties	3	10.0
Empowerment/confidence of farmers	3	10.0
Improved crop yield	2	6.7
Improved farmers income	2	6.7
Lower Input Costs	2	6.7
Organizational Strengthening of TaCRI and other farmers groups	1	3.3
Improved Quality	1	3.3
Gender Participation/Involvement	1	3.3
Minimization of Environmental Impact	1	3.3
Total Number of Responses	30	100.0

After group discussions capacity building remained the most frequently mentioned change resulting from the project. A new change was identified was cooperation between farmers. Examples given included the establishment of mother gardens where farmers all contributed materials (e.g. fertilizer), farmers applying for assistance jointly and advising each other.

Areas for further change were:

Further Change Required	Number of Individual Responses	Percentage Score
Lower Input Costs	2	33.3
Low availability of seedlings	1	16.7
Support to provided to all actors in coffee sub-sector	1	16.7
Targeting of Problems in totality	1	16.7
Lack of Water for Irrigation	1	16.7
Total No. Responses	6	100.0

Groups identified similar areas for further change to individuals where the main area for further change identified was to further reduce input costs. One respondent mentioned that the future interventions in the coffee sub-sector should target the problem in totality rather than focusing on individual problems. Looking at the problems in totality would include improving rural infrastructure in terms of the road network and water supply.

### 3.2 Group Change

Area of Change	Number of Individual Responses	Percentage Score
Access to new varieties	2	15.4
TA/Capacity Building	2	15.4
Increased Co-operation among farmers	2	15.4
Empowerment/confidence of farmers	2	15.4
Access to coffee processing machines	1	7.7
Improved farmers income	1	7.7
Increased Membership of Farmers Groups	1	7.7
Improved Quality	1	7.7
Ease of Acquiring Credit	1	7.7
Total Number of Responses	13	100.0

For farmers' groups the changes identified mostly paralleled those mentioned by individuals. Additional changes seen included increased access to coffee processing machines, increased membership of farmers groups and ease of acquiring credit. An increase in cooperation between farmers was also identified in the setting up and running of mother nurseries and giving each other advice.

Areas for further improvement identified were:

Further Change Required	Number of Individual Responses	Percentage Score
Low availability of seedlings	2	33.3
Lower Input Costs	1	16.7
Support to provided to all actors in coffee sub-sector	1	16.7
Targetting of Problems in totality	1	16.7
Lack of Water for Irrigation	1	16.7
Total No. Responses	6	100.0

Further changes required that affect farmers' groups mirrored the responses given by individuals. Particularly the low quantity of seedlings currently available and the need to lower input costs further.

### 3.3 Community Change

Area of Change	Number of Individual Responses	Percentage Score
Empowerment/confidence of farmers	2	28.6
Improved farmers income	1	14.3
Welfare of Farmers	1	14.3
Increased number of farmers groups	1	14.3
Improved quality of coffee	1	14.3
Increase in Tax Revenue from Agriculture	1	14.3
Total Number of Responses	7	100.0

Changes seen to affect the local community included the increased quality and therefore price of coffee which was believed to result in increased tax revenue for GoT which should benefit the whole community. Benefits were also seen in terms of the welfare and confidence of farmers and an increase in farmers groups.

## 4 Economic Changes

A number of economic changes had been highlighted in the individual and group discussions of change. Groups were asked to expand further on the changes seen that have been a result of the EC support to TaCRI.

Participants agreed that five main areas of economic change were seen:

- Reinvigoration of the coffee sector

A number of participants mentioned during discussions that TaCRI's interventions through the introduction of new varieties and capacity building initiatives has motivated some farmers to return to coffee farming after years of abandonment and others to continue with a new found confidence in coffee. This motivation to farmers to continue cultivating coffee as a cash crop has already been seen to have an impact on those farmers' economic situation.

- Employment

Group consensus was that self-employment in coffee-farming and employment of labour by farmers had increased threefold in the past five years.

- Input Costs

Costs of cultivating coffee such as fertilizer and pesticides have decreased as a result of TaCRI's technology transfer initiatives. Initiatives that included:

- Use of locally available herbs as an alternative to more expensive chemical pesticides
- Methods of conserving soil and water

These combined with the new varieties resistance to common diseases (CLR and CBD) which result in a reduced need for pesticide has lowered the overall input costs.

- Yield and Farmers income

The level of coffee production has increased dramatically as a result of the new varieties of coffee. The new varieties yield 2-3 Kg/Tree compared to just 0.5 Kg/Tree for the old varieties.

For example, the WABOKASHA farmers group's production has increased annual production from 2,700 Kg for its 28 members to 10,500 Kg.

- Quality and Price of Coffee

The consensus was that the coffee beans from the new varieties are of a higher quality and that this has resulted in farmers being able to sell coffee for a higher price. The price of new varieties of coffee has increased from 1,000 TShs per Kg before the project to 1,500 TShs per Kg now.

## **5 Technology Transfer, Technical Assistance and Capacity Building**

Groups were asked to discuss impacts in terms of technology transfer, technical assistance and capacity building that has resulted from the EC supported project.

Extension services to farmers' groups have provided technology transfer services including:

- Dissemination of new improved varieties (N39-1,2,3,4 and KP423-1) which are high yielding, tolerant to diseases, labour-saving due to limited pruning requirement.
- Methods of grafting traditional coffee plants with the new varieties
- Alternative ways of fertilizing the soil as well as soil and water conservation
- The use of local herbs and alcohol in pest control
- Techniques for identifying soil quality and managing/providing necessary nutrients for the coffee crop (nutrient management in coffee farm)
- Knowledge of preparing and raising the cuttings
- Best way of inter-cropping coffee and banana trees

Capacity Building had been achieved through training and technical assistance including:

- TaCRI has organised farmers days four times a year in Kilimanjaro region. During a farmers day participants have the opportunity to receive training from experts.
- Facilitation of events that allow Kilimanjaro farmers to meet their peers from other regions or countries (Malawi, Kenya) and share experiences.
- Information on TaCRI technologies and activities are communicated to the public via radio, TV broadcasts and through using newsletters.
- Training is also provided at the research institute.

It was highlighted that whilst the capacity building efforts have been beneficial small farmers are still lacking managerial capacity.

## **6 Participation and Cross Cutting Issues**

Finally focus group participants were asked to discuss the level of stakeholder and community participation in the planning of the EC supported project and how the cross cutting issues of HIV/AIDS, Sustainability and environment, were factored into the project planning and implementation.

- Apart from a few stakeholders who were involved in the development of TaCRI's Strategic action plan the community was not involved in the planning of the EC support project.
- Traditionally women of the Chagga tribe do not play any role in decision making or planning. Coffee farming is considered a "man's crop therefore women did not participate fully in the project. However one participant stated that his wife is now a member of a farmers group and would be able to continue coffee farming should he pass away.
- During project training activities there was some efforts to educate farmers and farmers groups in the impact of HIV/AIDS on agriculture.
- The new varieties of coffee are disease resistant which has resulted in a reduction in the use of chemicals that degrade the environment.
- Participants believed that after the project is phased out the impacts will continue to be seen as farmers will continue to grow the improved coffee varieties and the benefits of the capacity building will remain.

## ANNEX

The focus group discussions were conducted and transcribed in Kiswahili. The following is an English translation of the participant responses to discussion questions.

- **Discussion 1) Change**
  - **Individual-level changes and results from groups' discussions**
    - **Individual-level changes**

Individual-level changes were presented by participants without discussion with other group members. The statements below are presented as the participants wrote them on a paper. Each participant changes which have occurred to him/her in the past five years.

### **Participant No. 1**

- Actually, to have a foundation (TaCRI) on which to build and to create policies.
- Simply stated: Without the Coffee Leaf Rust (CLR) and CBD resistant varieties developed by CRS and TaCRI we would be achieving nothing.
- Personally, I have been following developments for last seven years. However, I have only been able only to acquire 200 mother nursery plants in 2004, apart from 50 plants obtained in 2000.
- Actual plants in field excluding the 200 mother plants are equal to 2150 plus purchased 1000 make a total of 3150, my demand is for another 120,000 but this will take 40 years, so *'tunataka miche haraka! – we need coffee seedlings fast!'*
- Thanks TaCRI and EC the way you are empowering farmers

### **Participant No. 2**

The benefits that I have seen as TaCRI researcher are:

- Releasing new improved varieties for the first time in 50 years! We have released five new improved coffee varieties and the other four will be out this year
- Partnership for sharing experiences with researchers from other countries, international institutions through seminars, international workshops, ASIC, EAFCA
- Technology transfer which is done through the media such as radio, TV and newspaper
- Travel to different places where coffee is produced in order to get a real picture

Problems

- More challenge! Increased burden of activities, fewer workers, the target/milestones are as they were before the project while the working staff is inadequate.

### **Participant No. 3**

- Acquired education/knowledge of producing new improved coffee varieties
- We sit together in our groups and talk about the new varieties and work collectively in our seedlings nursery up to when the seedlings get into our farms
- We attend different seminars
- My farm has started to show impressive changes in the area planted with new improved coffee seedlings though this area is small
- I have the new motivation of producing seedlings of the new varieties and later I will realize more produce from a small plot
- I have started using locally available material (in the nursery) in order to reduce costs, these materials include soil and wooden poles
- Use of insecticides against insect pests from the local herbs in our area
- My wife is a member of a group even if I am not in this world she can continue with coffee farming

### **Participant No. 4**

TaCRI programme has enabled the following to happen:

- Production of coffee has increased from 0.2kg/tree to 5kg/tree hence increase in income
- Quality of coffee has increased hence increase of the auction price
- Use of chemical inputs has decreased leading to decrease in production costs hence more savings
- More farmers have acquired training on husbandry and preparation of improved coffee

The problems are as follows:

- Majority of farmers have not yet benefited from this project, the project is very slow (more actors should have been involved in the process of disseminating the seedlings of new improved coffee varieties)
- Water availability (for irrigating the coffee nursery) in places which are short of water supply
- The costs of maintaining the nursery are high
- The costs of procuring the seedlings from TaCRI are high

### **Participant No. 5**

Individual-level benefits are:

- Economic progress (as a result of coffee production)
- Regain of hope in coffee production
- A farmer becomes more confident, because he has acquired education/knowledge on coffee production

### **Participant No. 6**

Benefits related to TaCRI programme:

- Availability and dissemination of new improved coffee varieties seedlings to farmers
- Education on the best practice of inter-cropping coffee and banana trees
- Education on how to produce the seedlings through vegetative cuttings
- Assistance in the formation of farmers groups
- Farmers have been motivated to seek advice from experts
- Women have been involved in the revival and progress of coffee sub-sector
- Farmers have realized that EC is helping them following the visit paid by EC delegates to farmers

Problems:

- Inadequate capacity for producing the seedlings (lack of funds) to pay for fertilizer, mulching material, and irrigation water

Opinions/suggestions:

- The EC support should help all institutions involved in the development of coffee industry (research, extension, production, processing and marketing)
- The support should be problem targeting

### **Participant No. 7**

Changes that have occurred:

- New improved coffee which is resistant to CBD and leaf rust is available, before the project there were none. This has revived the new spirit for coffee production
- Education on coffee husbandry has become more open than before
- Despite that we have not yet realized enough produce but the production costs have declined

### **Participant No. 8**

Changes related to EC support (2000- 2005):

- I have been motivated to engage myself in growing coffee after it has been transformed to regain its former commercial status due to introduction of new varieties

- Training on different production methods like budding and grafting and proper handling of nursery
- Promotion of organic farming especially in coffee production due to the introduction of new varieties

### **Participant No. 9**

Changes related to EC support (2000- 2005):

- This support from EC has opened up an opportunity to a farmer after he is able to get the coffee which is resistant to CBD and Coffee Leaf Rust (CLF). This is because these two diseases are the ones which reduce yields and cost the farmer to buy pesticides. After the EU support which has enabled TaCRI to produce and disseminate new improved coffee farmers have restarted to produce coffee. More groups of farmers have opened own nurseries for producing the seedlings of improved varieties under the technical advice of TaCRI staff. This coffee is of high quality and has a good taste
- Because TaCRI is serving the whole country, if possible, individuals and groups can be allowed to work in partnership with TaCRI to raise and disseminate the planting material (seedlings/cuttings) in order to make the uptake process faster
- As a result of TaCRI programme I have managed to increase production and get good prices, now farmers or group members are getting good prices for their coffee

### **Problems**

- The quality of coffee has not yet attained its level as good pulping and having a factory for drying and packing into clean sacks and clean storage facility are needed
- Farmers' organizations should be empowered in order for them to have voice in the government as opposed to the case of individual farmers
- Problems are there as still the farmer is not getting impressive prices and crop taxes further reduce farmer's income, input prices are higher than farmer's ability to pay. Also there are some insect pests '*kimatire*' - millback.
- Roads going to rural areas are still poor

### **Participant No. 10**

Changes related to EC support (2000- 2005):

- Farmers had lost hope, the availability of new improved seedlings has instilled a new spirit and determination to continue producing coffee
- New improved coffee will increase income of individual farmers
- Access to agricultural education and extension on coffee production

- Availability of new improved coffee which is disease resistant and high yielding, therefore reducing production costs
- Farmers have become confident with TaCRI, it is a saviour
- Yield of coffee per tree has increased up to 2 kgs when the crop is well maintained the yield could reach 3 kg per tree at an age of 5 years. Before the project the yield per tree was less than half a kilo
  - **Results from group discussions**

Each group was then asked to discuss the change further under three headings:

- Changes affecting individuals
- Changes affecting farmers' groups
- Changes affecting the community

Groups were asked to prepare a presentation of their consensus on each of type of change and then one member of the group presented the changes to the other groups.

### **Group No. 1**

#### **a) Summary of individual-level changes**

- Farmers have interest or spirit to continue with coffee production following availability of improved coffee seedlings, increased yield, declined costs of production and increased income
- Acquiring of agricultural education and extension on preparation and production of improved coffee
- Farmers have confidence with the coffee research institute after TaCRI has been able to be closer to farmers
- Yield per tree has increased up to 2 kg from less than half a kilo before the project

#### **b) Summary of negative individual-level changes**

- The seedlings of improved coffee require much water which is a problem in most places (thus leading to the requirement of mulching material)
- The seedlings require much fertilizer (demand for farm yard manure is high)

#### **c) Positive impacts of groups**

For the project putting an emphasis on the concept of group formation the following benefits have been realized:

- Availability of mother seedlings has been easier
- Extension services have widely reached more farmers
- The interest of farmers to receive coffee has increased
- It has been easier to get support (machine CPU – central pulper units)

- It has become easier to undertake various works collectively in the factory and making terraces in the farms
- Promotion of improved coffee has been effective through encouragements amongst members in groups
- Increased spirit of cooperation in the community

**d) Community benefits of the project**

- The community has understood and has been motivated to revive coffee crop

**e) Problems associated with the project**

- The seedlings are not enough (to meet the demand) because TaCRI, groups, individuals and other institutions do not have the adequate capacity to produce and disseminate the seedlings

**3.2 Group No. 2**

**a) Summary of individual-level changes**

- Availability of improved seedlings to farmers
- The project has given farmers education on coffee husbandry
- Education of replacing local with improved coffee is widespread among farmers
- Education on production of seedlings from the cuttings/buds is widespread
- Education on best arrangement of banana – coffee intercropping is widespread among farmers
- Good price of coffee and low costs of maintaining improved coffee compared to local varieties have improved profitability from the farming of improved varieties

**b) Summary of negative individual-level changes**

- Inadequate capacity (financially) to invest in the production of seedlings of improved coffee
- Availability of seedlings of improved coffee is slow compared to the demand

**c) Positive impacts of groups**

- Group membership has increased for example in WABOKASHA group the number of members has increased from 20 before the project to 40 members after the project
- Availability of seedlings of improved coffee to group members, for example in WABOKASHA group every member has obtained 30 mother seedlings
- Ease of acquiring credit
- Easy accessibility to training on good farming of coffee from by experts to group members
- As a result of training on coffee production the quality of has increased, for example in WABOKASHA group the price has increased from Tshs 1,000 per kg before the project to Tshs 1,500 per kg after the project (this change is due to quality improvement)

#### **d) Community benefits of the project**

- Villagers have acquired interest to revive the abandoned coffee farms
- More groups have been formed from 150 before the project to 230 after the project

#### **e) Problems associated with the project**

- Availability of irrigation water is not very excellent
- Improved coffee requires much fertilizer thus increasing costs
- Demand for seedlings of improved coffee is higher than availability

### **3.3 Group No. 3**

#### **a) Summary of individual-level changes**

- Access to education (new technologies) for coffee production
- Availability of seedlings of improved coffee
- Availability of material required for production of seedling of improved coffee (usage of papers – local material)
- Attendance of training and seminars
- Prepare and attend farmers' days
- Attending training visits
- New improved coffee has induced organic farming of coffee
- Instigation of rejuvenation of coffee
- Assist in the formation farmers' groups
- Establishment of mother gardens and farmers being ready to contribute material like fertilizer etc
- Farmers have started to look for experts
- Farmers are cooperating as a result of emerging interest in coffee production
- Farmers apply for and get help collectively
- Villagers have chance to correct each other
- Women are involved in the revival of coffee
- Some farmers who have acquired education have become teachers of their colleagues
- Farmers have realized that EU is supporting them after they were visited by EU
- Production has increased for example in WABOKASHA group production has increased from 2700 kg for all of its 28 members before the project to 10500 kg after the project
- The quality of coffee has improved and the price now is good for example members of WABOKASHA producer price has increased from Tshs per kg before the project to Tshs 1500 per kg after the project
- The research institution (TaCRI) is now closer to farmers by working directly with farmers

- Formation of new farmer groups for example in Sumi there was only one group now there are 6 groups

**b) Community benefits of the project**

- Realization of quality coffee hence good price
- Increased government incomes
- The welfare of farmers has improved

**c) Problems/suggestions**

- The support has to assist all institutions involved in the coffee industry (research, extension, production, processing and marketing)
- The support should target the problem in totality

- **Discussion 2) Economic/livelihood changes**

This section includes changes related to economic changes seen by participants and included discussion of changes in employment opportunities, sales price of produce, availability of produce and farmers income.

Participants were asked to expand on earlier discussions of change which identified a number of economic changes and then to agree on the main economic changes seen.

Group discussions identified the following as the main areas where change has occurred:

- Self-employment in farming and employment of labour has increased threefold
- The quality and price of coffee have increased and the market has become reliable
- Production and farmers' income have increased

○ **Discussion 3) Technology Transfer, Technical Assistance and Capacity Building**

Technology transfer, technical assistance and capacity building were provided to farmers and farmers groups in the form of production and dissemination of new improved seedlings, development and transfer of technology and training. Groups were asked to identify the main changes (positive and negative) that have occurred.

Changes related to technology transfer included:

- New improved varieties which are produced and disseminated by TaCRI are N39-1,2,3,4 and KP423-1 these varieties are high yielding, tolerant to diseases, labour-saving in due to limited pruning requirement compared to old varieties
- Knowledge of identifying soil quality in the farm
- Knowledge of preparing and raising the cuttings
- Growing traditional herbs as expellants of insect pests
- Grafting technology involving the use of traditional and new improved varieties (the new variety is adjoined on top of the cutting of local variety which serves as a sink)
- Means of soil and water conservation
- Alternative ways of fertilizing the soil
- Knowledge on how to manage and provide nutrients for the coffee crop (nutrient management in coffee farm)
- Best way of inter-cropping coffee and banana trees
- Extension approach which uses the concept of group formation (organized extension – group by group)
- Use of alcohol to control coffee insect pests

Training approaches for technology transfer were identified by participants to be:

- Farmers' days are usually implemented once a year nationally and regionally, but TaCRI has adapted this system by organizing farmers' days amongst farmers' groups more frequently, for example this year TaCRI has facilitated farmers' days through groups four times in Kilimanjaro region. During these farmers' days best groups are rewarded accordingly
- Enabling farmers in Kilimanjaro region to meet farmers from other regions or countries such as Malawi, Kenya
- Information on technologies and activities done by TaCRI are communicated to the public via radio and TV broadcasts

- Training is also done at the research institute (on station training), and through using newsletters etc

Comment:

- Managerial capability by small farmers is lacking

- **Discussion 4) Participation and cross-cutting issues**

Finally focus group participants were asked to discuss the level of stakeholder and community participation in the planning of the EC supported project and how the cross cutting issues of HIV/AIDS, Sustainability and environment, were factored into the project planning and implementation.

### **Community participation**

- In the project planning phase the beneficiaries were not involved fully apart from a few representatives of different stakeholders were involved in a meeting which endorsed the TaCRI Strategic Action Plan (SAP).

### **Gender participation**

- According to the culture of the Chagga, ethnic women have no chance in the decision making process and do not benefit from coffee. In Kilimanjaro region, women do not own land and historically coffee is a crop for men. Therefore women did not participate fully in the project apart from their involvement behind the shoulders of their husbands

### **HIV/AIDS:**

- The project has included an aspect of HIV/AIDS by implementing activities that have educated farmers and farmers groups on the impacts of HIV/AIDS in the agriculture sector. These negative impacts include shortage of family labour force as a result of HIV/AIDS related deaths.

### **Environment:**

- The participants agreed that the project improves the environment because by cultivating the new coffee varieties which are resistant to CLR and CBD reduces the use of chemicals which degrade the environment

### **Sustainability:**

- The participants agreed that even after the project phases out they will still be able to continue growing improved coffee because the project has built the capacity of farmers' group and farmers. The capacity has been built by involving farmers in various project activities like preparation and husbandry of mother plots (nurseries) of improved seedlings and grafted

cuttings, management and farmers' group governance, and usage of local herbs as expellants of coffee insect pests

ANNEX  
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

S/N	Name	Organisation
1	Clement Mwinuka	TaCRI
2	Deusdedit Kilambo	TaCRI
3	Daniel Muro	Mwave Farmers Group
4	E.L. Mushi	Wabokasha
5	F.S. Olendukai	TCCO Ltd
6	A.N. Kishumba	Farmer
7	F.J. Nyansi	TCB
8	F.K. Temu	Ledeza Farmers Group
9	Macky Shao	Mrimbo Uwwo
10	Sebastion Umbella	Tumaini Coffee Rehabilitation Group
11	Gabriel Lyatuu	KNCU
12	Elijah Matee	KNCU
13	Marios Ghikas	Nkwansira Coffee Estates
14	John Lamayan	Envirocare
15.	David Munisi	Farmer
16.	Gabriel Ulomi	G32 Kili Coffee Cooperative
17.	Hermence Laswai	Farmer

# **ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES (EDI)**

## **ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPACT OF EC SUPPORT TO THE AGRICULTURE SECTOR IN TANZANIA**

**REPORT No. 2  
RESPONSES FROM FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS  
(EC SUPPORT TO MVIWATA)  
PVD 2003 021-180**

**AUGUST, 2005**

## **1. Introduction**

### **1.1 Purpose of the Focus Group Discussion (FGD)**

The Focus Group Discussion was held in order to investigate the changes and impacts resulting from EC support to the Tanzania Farmers Organisation (MVIWATA) in the development of income generating activities (PVD/2003/021-180).

The overall objective of the project was to contribute to improving the living conditions of the Tanzanian rural population, and participate in the growth of Tanzania national economy. By helping farmers achieve higher, more reliable and more regular incomes and by strengthening the network's influence on decision making regarding rural development.

### **1.2 Participants**

The Focus group included various actors involved in the agricultural sector in Kilimanjaro Region including representatives of<sup>1</sup>:

MVIWATA

Savings and Credit Organisations (SACCOS)

Small Holders

Community representatives

Large scale farmers

Cooperatives

TCCIA

### **1.3 Date and Location**

The focus group discussion was held on 17<sup>th</sup> August 2005 in Moshi town, the regional capital of Kilimanjaro.

### **1.4 Structure of Focus Group Discussion**

After a brief introduction from the principal facilitator on the purpose of the discussions participants were split into four groups.

The discussions were split into two parts:

1. **GENERAL CHANGES:** what changes (positive and negative) had participants seen in the past five years at the level of individual, community and groups in relation to the EC supported project. Participants were first asked to individually identify changes that they have personally

experienced in the past five years as a result of this intervention. Then each group discussed changes that have occurred in terms of changes that have affected them as a group and their community.

2. **BENEFITS TO FARMERS AND ORGANISATIONS:** In the second half of the day participants were split into four groups. Two groups included farmers, workers and community members and the remaining two groups included representatives of SACCOS, MVIWATA and other farmers organisations.

Both groups were asked to expand their discussions of the benefits of EC supported project to focus on change in terms of

- Economic Changes, including employment opportunities and income generation
- Access to basic social services (education and health) and living standards
- Participation of the community
- Gender Participation

In addition groups representing organisations were asked to discuss the benefits of the project to their organisations.

To ensure maximum participation of participants the workshop was conducted in Kiswahili. The outcomes of each discussion were transcribed and then translated into English. The English language transcription of the main responses is included as an annex.

The following sections present a summary of each discussion area including rankings of each area of change/impact and key discussion points.

---

<sup>1</sup> A full list of participants is provided in the annex of this report.

## 2. Summary of Individual-level changes

Participants were asked to individually write down all changes that they have observed in the past five years that have affected themselves personally. Identified changes are summarised below<sup>2</sup>.

Area of Change	Individual Responses	Percentage Score (%)
Access to Credit/Loans	16	26.67
Increase in farmers productivity/income	9	15.00
Capacity Building/Technical Assistance	8	13.33
Access to new SACCOS	4	6.67
Access to Storage Loans/Facilities	4	6.67
Ability to pay for basic services (Education/Health)	4	6.67
Increased value of shares in SACCOS	3	5.00
Improved Living Conditions (Building a house, food)	3	5.00
Increase in SACCOS facilities	2	3.33
Recognition of farmers	2	3.33
Increased employment opportunities	2	3.33
Access to Savings accounts	1	1.67
Increase in SACCOS members	1	1.67
Poverty Reduction	1	1.67
Total No. Responses	60	100

The three main benefits identified were:

### 1. Access to credit and loan facilities

Credit facilities have been used to buy fertiliser, seedlings and other inputs, acquire cattle and irrigation as well as for expanding farms. SACCOS loan facilities have enabled a number of participants to invest not only in their farms but also in setting up other businesses. Aside from using the credit and loan facilities for investment, members are also able to borrow money in times of ill-health and to pay for their children's schooling.

### 2. Increased Productivity and Income

As a result of capacity building initiatives farmers are able to use more efficient methods of farming and increase their productivity. The yield of crops per acre has also been increased from farmers' ability to store crops immediately after harvest and then plant a second crop. For example one participant has increased his yield of maize from 10 bags per acre to 25 bags. This increase in productivity has resulted in farmers incomes increasing.

---

<sup>2</sup> A full transcription of participants responses is included in the annex of this document.

### 3. Capacity Building and Technical Assistance

Participants also highlighted the access to capacity building training as an important benefit of the project. Farmers have benefited from training by experts in efficient farming methods whilst SACCOS staff have received training in financial management and have also benefited from sharing skills and experiences with other SACCOS.

Another important benefit has been farmers improved ability to pay for basic services such as schooling for their children and health services which has resulted from access to credit facilities as well as increased income.

Access to storage facilities that enable farmers to store their crops until they can be sold for a higher price instead of being forced to accept the market rate at the time of harvest. In 2003 a bag of maize sold for 15,000 TShs at the time of harvest but as a result of the storage facilities in 2005 the same farmer was able to wait until a better price was available and sold the same size bag for 25,000 TShs. Similarly a bag of rice could be sold for 25,000 TShs immediately after harvest but by using storage facilities farmers were able to sell the same bag for 46,000 TShs later in the year.

A number of areas where further change is still required were also identified:

Area for further change	Individual Responses	Percentage Score (%)
Provision of water for irrigation/drought	4	26.67
Size of loans/capital to increase	3	20.00
Further Capacity Building needed	3	20.00
National policy towards SACCOS not supportive	2	13.33
Not all SACCOS have benefited	1	6.67
Improve rural roads	1	6.67
Construction of SACCOS buildings	1	6.67
Total No. Responses	15	100

The major concerns were:

1. The shortage of water, especially during times of drought, was felt to be a threat to the sustainability of SACCOS. Farmers were particularly concerned as to how they would repay their loans if a drought resulted in a failed harvest. It was suggested that MVIWATA/EC consider interventions that would minimise this threat such as the construction of reservoirs.

2. The size of the loans currently available are not adequate to meet farmers' needs and SACCOS do not have enough capital to support all target beneficiaries.
3. Whilst participants felt that they have benefited from MVIWATA/SACCOS training a number of participants felt that further training was still required for farmers, SACCOS staff and leaders.
4. Recent government policy relating to SACCOS was also seen as a problem. A recent policy states that to receive institutional support a SACCOS must have a capital of at least 500 million TShs which is unattainable for most SACCOS.

### 3. Summary of Group and Community Changes

Participants were split into three groups by gender, one group of women and two of men. Each group was asked to discuss the changes that they have seen in the past five years that have affected their group and their community.

Area	Individual Responses	Percentage Score (%)
Capacity Building/Technical Assistance	5	17.2
Increase in SACCOS members/beneficiaries	4	13.8
Access to Credit/Loans	3	10.3
Increase in SACCOS facilities/buildings	3	10.3
Ability to pay for basic services (Education/Health)	3	10.3
Access to new SACCOS	2	6.9
Access to Storage Loans/Facilities	2	6.9
Increased Gender Participation	2	6.9
Increased value of shares in SACCOS	1	3.4
Increase in farmers productivity/income	1	3.4
Increased employment opportunities	1	3.4
Transparency of SACCOS	1	3.4
Ability to invest in business	1	3.4
Total No. Responses	29	100

The main benefits identified were:

1. Capacity Building: Training provided by the SACCOS has enabled farmers to form groups to facilitate access to credit. SACCOS staff have benefited from capacity building in the efficient and transparent management of a rural bank.
2. Increase in SACCOS Members and Beneficiaries: The formation of 10 new SACCOS in different villages in Kilimanjaro region has meant that many more farmers have been able to become members of the SACCOS and benefit from their services. Membership of SACCOS associated with MVIWATA in Kilimanjaro has increased from 76 in 2002 to 2200 in July 2005. Aside from the direct members of the SACCOS their families also benefit from SACCOS support. One participant who was not yet a member of a SACCOS or MVIWATA reported that he had benefited because his relative received SACCOS credit which had allowed him to employ the participant in his shop.
3. Increased access to credit: Farmers Groups have benefited from access to a variety of credit mechanisms including
  - o Agricultural Credit for purchasing inputs
  - o Business Credit for setting up small businesses
  - o Social Service Credit for paying for school fees

- Emergency Credit in cases where a member is sick
  - Crop storage loans to enable farmers to store crops until crop prices increase
4. Increase in SACCOS buildings and facilities: EC support enabled three SACCOS to build their own offices and invest in office equipment strengthening the capacity of the SACCOS and reducing the organisations outlay on office rent. The office building has become the property of its members.
  5. Ability to pay for basic social services: Farmers increased income combined with access to social service credits has enabled many members to send their children to secondary school. They are also more able to pay for health for themselves and their families.

Areas identified where further change is needed include:

Area for further change	Individual Responses	Percentage Score (%)
Inadequate capital to meet demand	3	13.6
Further Capacity Building needed	3	13.6
National policy towards SACCOS not supportive	3	13.6
Not all SACCOS/members have benefited	3	13.6
Default of credit and misuse of loans	2	9.1
SACCOS not yet sustainable	2	9.1
Increased financial control needed	1	4.5
Increase participation of members	1	4.5
Conflict between SACCOS leaders and Village Government	1	4.5
Provision of water for irrigation/drought	1	4.5
Improve rural roads	1	4.5
Construction of SACCOS buildings	1	4.5
Total No. Responses	22	100.0

The main concerns identified include:

1. SACCOS have inadequate capital to meet the demands of an increasing number of members. SACCOS need to raise capital.
2. SACCOS staff and leaders need further training in record keeping, financial management. Good governance and accountability.
3. National policies, as mentioned previously, are having a negative impact on SACCOS.
4. Not all SACCOS and SACCOS members have benefited fully from the EC support.
5. A threat that was identified was that farmers can not always repay credit due to a bad harvest, poor weather, poor planning and lack of reliable markets for their produce.

## **4.0 Group Discussions**

In the second half of the day participants were split into four groups.

Groups 1 and 2 included representatives of MVIWATA, SACCOS and other farmers' organisations. This group were asked to discuss the benefits of EC support to MVIWATA and SACCOS in terms of the services and benefits of those services to farmers as well as the organisations ability to deliver services and support farmers.

Groups 3 and 4 included farmers and representatives of the community. This group were asked to discuss the benefits to farmers in terms of economic benefits and living standards.

The following sections contain a combined summary of the results of these group discussions.

### **4.1 Income Generating Activities**

Support from SACCOS and MVIWATA has benefited farmers through:

- Increased access to banking services including credit, savings and expert financial advice. The formation of 10 new SACCOS in different villages has brought these services much closer to the beneficiaries
- The ability to borrow money to invest in materials and equipment such as bicycles, mobile phones, installation of electricity, solar power devices, building and farming materials
- Access to credit for the purchase of agricultural inputs, such as fertilizer and seeds
- Storage facilities that allow farmers to store crops until a better price can be achieved. For example, in 2004 a farmer sold Maize for 15,000 TShs immediately after harvest but in 2005 he used the stores and his sold maize for 25,000 TShs at a later date. Similarly, rice sold for 25,000 TShs per bag after harvest but can now be sold for 46,000 TShs by waiting for a better price.
- Until the introduction of storage facilities the majority of crops were purchased by middle men who had significant bargaining power and were able to dictate prices.
- Storage facilities allow farmers to cultivate a second crop on the same piece of land doubling their crop yield and income.

### **4.2 Employment Opportunities**

The project has resulted to increased employment opportunities in the community:

- SACCOS are now able to employ staff. Prior to the project no SACCOS in the region employed staff now there are 25 SACCOS staff (12 male and 13 female). These posts include watchmen, office assistants and savings and loan officers.
- Farmers are now able to employ more casual labourers during harvest as a result of their increased incomes.
- Availability of business credit to the local youth has encouraged them to stay in their villages rather than move to urban areas.

### **4.3 Living Standards**

The project has also resulted in improved living standards of the SACCOS members and beneficiaries:

- Participants agreed that living standards had improved by 50 %
- Members shares in the SACCOS have increased in value
- Members are now able to send their children to secondary school by using the social services credit
- Members are now able to pay for health services
- Households are now able to eat a proper meal three times a day, whereas in the past they would only eat once or twice a day
- Families are able to build better homes using their increased income and credits for building materials

### **4.3 Capacity Building**

Members have benefited from capacity building training related to:

- Cooperatives, improved agriculture and livestock keeping methods
- Crop storage and fumigation

## **5 Benefits to Farmers Organisations (MVIWATA and SACCOS)**

EC support has increased the capacity of MVIWATA in Kilimanjaro region which has resulted in:

- The formation of 10 new SACCOS
- The increase in the number of SACCOS has enabled the organisation to reach a larger number of beneficiaries up from 76 members in 2002 to 2200 in 2005.
- The SACCOS are able to provide these members with assistance in terms of credit, capital, training and materials.
- The support has enabled MVIWATA to represent farmers at a national level more effectively and its relationship with the EC has given MVIWATA additional status.
- MVIWATA has been able to provide training to SACCOS staff and leaders.
- MVIWATA now has more facilities including cars, motorbikes and computers which enable it to function more effectively.

Further interventions are needed to combat some remaining issues:

- SACCOS and credit recipients need further training
- SACCOS need further capital to support all target beneficiaries
- Frequent changes in national cooperative policies
- MVIWATA needs further organisational strengthening at the regional level in order to continue service provision.

## **6 Participation and Cross Cutting Issues**

MVIWATA representatives state that as a farmers organisation it is structured in a way that the organisations' national strategies and plans are based on its members needs. MVIWATA communicates with its members through workshops, meetings, a newsletter (Pambazuko) and through radio broadcasts. Constitutional meetings are held at group level, rural group networks, regional and national levels. Additionally participants noted that farmers are encouraged to evaluate MVIWATA services which they assist in developing and endorse.

Gender participation was also highlighted by participants who reported that women have benefited from credit and training which has enabled them to increase family incomes and gain respect. There are now two SACCOS for women only which currently have 190 members.

The issue of sustainability was not addressed directly but during discussions participants noted two constraints to the sustainability of the project:

- Water shortages caused by extended dry periods or drought resulting in failed harvest could cause farmers to default on their loans.
- The limited capital of the SACCOS means that they are unable to assist all potential beneficiaries.

Issues of HIV/AIDS and the environment were not addressed by participants.

## **ANNEX**

The focus group discussions were conducted and transcribed in Kiswahili. The following is an English translation of the responses presented by participants after each discussion question.

- **Discussion 1) Individual-level changes and results from groups' discussions**
  - **Individual-level changes**

Individual-level changes were presented by individuals without discussion with other participants. The statements below are presented as the participants wrote them on a paper. Each participant identified changes which have occurred to him/her in the past five years as a result of the EC supported project.

### **Participant No. 1**

- Farmers that are members of TCCIA have received training on improved coffee production offered by the TaCRI. As a result of this training farmers have managed to increase production and quality of coffee.
- Training has been offered by agriculture experts and farmers, in general farmers have benefited.

### **Participant No. 2**

- As a farmer, my SACCO has not benefited from this project despite being a member of MVIWATA. This is because in the past our leaders did not seek support from EC and FERT. However, I am confident that after a meeting we had with MVIWATA earlier this year, the EC will do whatever is possible to provide the farmers of Kindi development support to our SACCOS.

### **Participant No. 3**

#### **Benefits**

- Receiving credit of different kinds for agriculture, business, materials, emergencies etc
- Ability to keep savings
- Being a shareholder in the SACCOS
- Has given me recognition in society

#### **Problems**

- Frequent changes (uncalled for) in cooperative policies in the country
- Political interference into professional matters

#### **Participant No. 4**

##### **Benefits**

- Productivity has increased for example, production of maize has risen from 10 bags per acre before the project to 25 bags after the project
- Number of cattle (dairy) owned has increased from 1 before the project to 4 after the project
- Ease of getting inputs such as seeds, fertilizer
- An increase in the ability to pay for the education of children particularly in private schools
- Ability to pay for the children's health services has increased
- Group education has been further improved

##### **Problems:**

- The amount of loan should be increased as it is still small
- Further agricultural and business education is still needed

#### **Participant No. 5**

- Through this project I see that there will be further benefits to farmers particularly with the SACCOS reaching smallholder farmers in rural areas through IFAD, FERT etc. There is a need for this project to continue with credit provision to improve the SACCOS and educate the community.
- I suggest, if possible, that rural infrastructure should be improved particularly roads, SACCOS buildings, availability of water in places where villagers have water shortages by constructing water reservoirs

#### **Participant No. 6**

##### **Benefits**

- I have received training
- I have received credit for improving my farm
- I have received credit for business and social services
- The capacity of our SACCOS has grown
- My shares in the SACCOS have increased in value
- Crop storage loans have enabled me get good price for my crops
- Membership of my SACCOS has increased from 97 members before the project to 2200 members after the project

- I have been able to share experience with other SACCOS within and outside the region
- The SACCOS now has an office building and other facilities

### **Problems**

- Despite EC support the amount of capital is still inadequate compared to the number of members
- Further training is still needed
- Drought is a threat to farmers

### **Participant No. 7**

#### **Benefits**

The benefits I have received from the EC support

- I have used the money in agriculture, business and crop storage. The benefits from agriculture include having enough food and surplus for business. The benefits that I got from the credit is business, I made large profit and built a house

### **Participant No. 8**

First of all, myself I have been able to increase my income from the credit that I received:

- I have been able to buy improved seeds
- I have been able to increase production as I am now able to buy fertilizer
- We have been able to store some crops
- We have built our own SACCO building
- I have hopes that after a while we also build a storage facility for storing crops after harvest when prices are low

### **Participant No. 9**

- As a farmer and member of a SACCOS I have benefited from this programme, as I have been able to get credit which has assisted me in my farming for increasing production. With this credit I have managed to buy inputs and practice improved farming. In the past I have had difficulty farming, as I was unable to purchase inputs because of my poor economic situation when I was harvesting very little.

### **Participant No. 10**

- I am a normal farmer and I have benefited a lot from MVIWATA. I have been working as salesperson in a shop owned by my relative who has received credit from a SACCOS. He has

been paying me a salary which has enabled me to engage myself in farming by renting farm plots and keeping animals. The benefits I have seen from my relative are that I have been able to send my children to school, we now have enough food at home, and we have built a small house for the family. We also have some savings in the SACCOS. As a farmer I am cooperating with my SACCOS and in my opinion MVIWATA is helpful and it should continue its work.

#### **Participant No. 11**

- I have seen benefits from the credit I received from my SACCOS which I invested in irrigated farming to produce crops like beans and maize, these are crops that I am used to cultivating. For the crops that I harvest I calculate whether I have made enough profit to repay the credit and remain with some profit which enables me to develop. I will seek credit again to continue with farming
- Warning: farming is not easy and I am alert not to miss a harvest and fail to repay the credit
- Expectations: I am expecting to continue seeking credit and increase my share so that I benefit more because as my share increases I shall be able to farm more (more area) and increase my income

#### **Participant No. 12**

- An emphasis should be placed on talking about changes in the agriculture sector. I am a member of SACCOS. Since I joined the SACCOS I have realized impressive developments because I am getting credit. I am continuing with my activities and when I get stuck I seek help from SACCOS. SACCOS supports people who have little income in order to increase their income.
- I have benefited from SACCOS because I have engaged myself in farming and I see the benefits in terms of crop harvests which have enabled me send my children to school and pay for other needs, but it is major loss is when there is no rain. We are benefiting from SACCOS in reducing poverty and other problems.

#### **Participant No. 13**

Things that I have seen as benefits from EC support include:

- Establishment of new savings and credit organizations (SACCOS)
- Improvement of smallholders' income by giving them capital for them to be able to do activities including business, agriculture, keeping of livestock etc
- Bank services are now closer to people in rural areas
- Recognition of farmers and realization of their contribution to the economy

- Improvement and increase in the level of education
- In order to realize more benefits it is important to further improve education

#### **Participant No. 14**

- Access to credit for expanding agriculture
- My income has further increased
- My family has been able to solve problems following increased income and efficiency of activities
- The credit is not adequate to meet demands of the community; the money offered by SACCOS is too small to satisfy the whole community.

#### **Participant No. 15**

- I have received benefits by working for farmers who are members of MVIWATA as a casual labourer, and now I plan to join a SACCOS in order to benefit more and get more education from MVIWATA

#### **○ Summary of individual level benefits**

This summary was prepared by a facilitator and presented to the focus group after reviewing the statements given by individual participants. Participants agreed that the following is an accurate summary of the changes that have affected themselves as individuals.

#### **Benefits**

- Creation of primary and secondary employment
- Access to credit for agriculture and business
- Increased income
- Families have been able to solve problems as result of increased income
- Increased efficiency in different activities including agriculture, business
- Increased ability of sending children to school after the income has improved
- Bank services are closer to the people after starting more SACCOS
- The level of education/knowledge has increased
- Food security has increased (e.g. yield of maize has increased from 10 bags per acre before the project to 25 bags after the project)
- House construction
- Inputs are more available e.g. improved seeds, fertilizer
- SACCOS has got its office building and in the near future it is expecting to have the storage facility

- Shares and number of SACCOS members have increased for example the number of members has increased from 76 before the project to 2200 members after the project
- Group education and importance of groups have improved
- Training of experts has improved

### **Problems/suggestions**

- Credit does not match the demand
- Drought is a threat to the success of SACCOS
- Further training is still needed (agricultural and business education)
- Rural infrastructure should be improved (roads, SACCOS buildings, water supply infrastructure like construction of dams/reservoirs)
- Frequent (uncalled for) changes of the national cooperative policies
- Interference politics in professional matters
- *Suggestions:* my SACCOS has yet benefited because our leader did not make follow-up in the past, we are confident that EC is going to assist us in the near future

### ○ **Results from group discussions**

#### **Group No. 1**

Group No. 1 presented the results of its discussion by combining the changes seen by both the group and community:

#### **Benefits**

- Because of EC support, there has been an increase in the number of SACCOS members as people have seen the benefits accrued to founder members
- Credit is available all the time for development activities and peoples' needs
- Education has been provided by SACCOS to establish groups for efficient access to credit from SACCOS for development of economic activities which have been initiated by those groups. As a result of this, changes have happened in commercial production which is profitable
- We have bank services closer to villagers who are the targeted beneficiaries. As a result of this we have benefited in the following aspects:
  - a) The bank building which is owned by members

- b) Our capacity to send our children to school has increased as our incomes have improved, this has increased the number of student in schools (secondary)
- c) Villagers have been able to contribute for school construction
- d) Realization of the importance of food storage in the community storage facility
- Credit through SACCOS has emancipated women in different domains as follows:
  - a) Women have the capacity to manage their activities
  - b) Have increased the family income
  - c) They are respected and valued by husbands following their contribution in production and income in the family
  - d) Importance of educating women has been realized
  - e) Women are heard and can make wise decisions

### **Problems**

- Education is still needed for the target beneficiaries to make SACCOS sustainable until a stage is reached where they can stand on their own without being dependent on support
- Participation/cooperation amongst clients, experts and donors should be increased and improved
- Control/audit of finance in all SACCOS should be stressed further

### **Group No. 2**

This group presented results from its discussion on two aspects in relation to changes that have occurred at group and community/village levels.

#### **Group level changes**

##### ***Benefits***

The economic situation of a farmer before the EC support was poor, as farmers had low economic capacity. Benefits that have been realized after the EC support through MVIWATA/SACCOS include:

- Farmers have a place to go for credit (saviour of farmers)
- Education for leaders and farmers has been improved
- Openness in keeping accurate/quality records has increased
- Farmers have been motivated to join SACCOS to large extent
- Production of crops per unit area has increased provided the rainfall situation is good
- Credit from SACCOS has helped farmers/members in: education, health, dietary food, quality housing, clothing, production of crops/livestock, and ability to construct SACCOS buildings and storage facilities

##### ***Problems***

- This support has not yet reached the majority of the targeted beneficiaries
- The capital provided is small compared to the number of members
- Education to leaders and members is inadequate, for example:
  - a) Keeping of cooperative records
  - b) Keeping of financial books of accounts and the money itself
  - c) Good governance and accountability (not just a leader)
  - d) Motivation/promotion
- The fate of SACCOS after the EC support is not understood
- Many SACCOS in this period of five years are not yet well established. Therefore EC should continue to improve them
- Lack of office buildings for SACCOS
- Failure of members to repay the credit within the right time. This has been caused by:
  - a) Changes of weather situation (drought)
  - b) Poor business planning and failure to enter into business competition
  - c) Lack of reliable markets and limited power for price bargaining, middlemen buy crops immediately after crop harvest and they dictate the price

### **Community/village level changes**

#### ***Benefits***

- Increased employment in the village
- Food security
- Establishment of SACCOS
- Increased ability of farmers to contribute in education, health, and participation in community functions

#### ***Problems***

- Conflicts between SACCOS leaders and the village governments
- This support has yet reached more target beneficiaries
- Some members do not spend the credit wisely

### **Group No. 3**

This group presented the results from its discussion by assessing the situation before and after project. Group and community/village level changes were presented altogether without separating the two levels. Project benefits were presented in the form of a table as follows:

BEFORE PROJECT	AFTER PROJECT
There was only one SACCOS called Jitegemee	Now there are eleven SACCOS
Number of SACCOS members was 76 in 2002	Now there are 2200 members by July 2005
Shares of SACCOS amounted to TShs 1,200,000	Now shares have increased to the value of TShs 36,700,000
No SACCOS employees	Now there are 25 employees, 13 women and 12 men
Record keeping was poor	Monthly financial reports are presented in time Balancing of ledger of members and main ledger is done daily Auditing of money is done daily (internal) Auditing reports are made available annually
SACCOS used to rent offices	SACCOS offices have been built for three SACCOS
Financial control and auditing was nonexistent	Now SACCOS do control finances and auditing is done by experts of the project and SACCOS
Beneficiaries of SACCOS were 76x4 = 304	Now the number of beneficiaries is 2200x4 = 8800
Training did not exist	Now there is training of members, committee, borrowers, workers
Credit which was provided was commercial	Now credit are offered in the following areas: <i>Agricultural credit</i> – for purchasing inputs. Eighty percent of those who get this credit are farmers <i>Business credit</i> – this is for youths, women and elders for different businesses <i>Social services credit</i> – this is for education payment particularly secondary education <i>Emergency credit</i> – this is offered in case of disease incidence <i>Crop storage loan</i> – this aims at improving crop markets for storing the crops for later sales because prices are very low immediately after harvesting. Crops which are currently stored in different places include maize, paddy and lablab <i>Farm implements credit</i> – this aims at enabling the farmer to get production tools like carts, bicycles, ox-ploughs, sprayers, irrigation pumps <i>Construction material and assets credit</i> – this aims at enabling borrowers to get items like iron sheets, cement, carpentry tools for youths, oven machine for women for baking of bread and cake, refrigerators and deep freezers to youths for business purposes, Television and deck for recreation, home assets like beds, coaches, tables etc
SACCOS for women were nonexistent	Two SACCOS for women with 190 members have been established

### Problems

- Changes in cooperative policies
- Inadequate capital for lending to SACCOS

## **Discussion 2) Results of group discussions on specific aspects**

Other questions which were broadly discussed in groups included structure of MVIWATA, benefits of SACCOS, living standards/livelihood of farmers in the reference period (2000-2005), performance of MVIWATA/SACCOS. Groups No.1 and No. 2 discussed questions related to performance of MVIWATA/SACCOS. Groups No.3 and No.4 discussed the former three questions.

### **Results of discussions from Group No. 3 and No. 4**

#### ***Benefits of MVIWATA to farmers***

- Has enabled formation of farmers' groups
- We have been able to get credit support through MVIWATA
- Opening of a rural bank (SACCOS) through which we get financial services and economic advice from experts
- We have managed to build SACCOS offices: three offices have been built and storage facilities are to be built this year in the fourth phase of the project
- Participation in farmers' shows
- We have increased our income which did not exist in the past
- We have received education in cooperatives, agriculture and improved livestock keeping
- Farmers training visits
- MVIWATA is advising farmers not to adopt GMO
- Communication is made through the newsletter called *Pambazuko*, radio broadcast programmes although do not reach majority of farmers as people in rural areas do not listen to RTD
- We are not yet involved in MVIWATA's planning process because we are not direct members of MVIWATA
- We have not received training from MVIWATA directly

#### ***Benefits of SACCOS to farmers***

- We have benefited a lot from the credit offered through SACCOS. We are striving to ensure SACCOS continue to exist
- We have been able to keep savings
- The services received from SACCOS include:
  - a) Education
  - b) Security of our savings
  - c) Banking services are closer the village

- d) Visits for exchange of ideas/experience
- e) Attendance in various workshops
- Members have been able to get more credit which that have used to buy things like bicycles, mobile phones, installation of electricity in their houses, solar power devices, cement, irrigation pumps etc
- We have been empowered to evaluate services that we need through the constitution which we developed/endorsed ourselves
- Our SACCOS have good financial control by using internal and external auditors

### ***Storage facility***

- Storage facilities help us to store our crops while waiting for better prices
- Before we had storage programme we used to sell our crops immediately after harvesting. As a result of this we got losses for selling our produce at low prices, for example before the storage programme in 2003/04 a bag of maize sold for TShs 15,000 (immediately after harvest) but after storage programme in 2005 we sold the same bag of maize at TShs 25,000 (later after price has improved). Thus there has been a profit of TShs 10,000 per bag as a result of storage. Likewise, storage improved prices of bag of paddy rice (120kgs) from TShs 25,000 to TShs 46,000 last year
- Storage of food for the family
- Education on crop storage for example fumigation
- Possibility of cultivating twice after storage of the first crop
- SACCOS hire and improve houses of members to serve storage purposes before building the storage facilities
- There is no loan for construction of household storage facilities

### ***Employment***

- Also SACCOS have employed our relatives and children as clerks, SLO and watchmen
- Employment has been provided in different categories. For example Kindi SACCOS:
  - a) Has employed a watchman paid TShs 25,000 per month
  - b) Three office servants each one gets a salary of TShs 40,000 per month
- All farmers have been self-employed and they hire other people as casual labourers during critical times
- Cropped land (per farmer) has increased from 1 acre to 3 acre parallel with productivity of maize from 9 to 17 bags per acre

### ***Changes in living standards/livelihood***

- Livings standards of people have changed because the economic situation has been improved by 50%
- Income has increased for the family to increase her share and savings in the SACCOS
- Women who are majority of borrowers have been enabled to get income
- Ability to take children to school has increased. For example in the past children who passed their standard seven exams failed to attend secondary school, but now we have that capacity to pay the school fees using the social services credit
- Produce yields used to be low but now we are able use good farming methods and crop yields have improved
- Households are able to eat a proper diet three times a day before they used to eat twice or even once a day
- We are able to build better houses than those we had in the past by using the profit we earn from businesses and credit for building material
- Access to health services has increased because we are more able to pay for health services than before
- Outcomes of these changes in the family and the community are that the livelihoods of many families have changed and become more modern:
  - a) Education has improved
  - b) Health is impressive (we can take an emergency credit)
  - c) We possess modern houses
  - d) Clothing and nutrition have improved
- Community-wide there is now more employment in rural areas this has helped to prevent the migration of youths to towns because SACCOS are providing them with credit

### **Results of discussions from Group No. 1 and No. 2**

#### ***Provision of financial services***

- In Kilimanjaro region there are 10 new SACCOS which were established by the project
- Members who benefits from the services offered by SACCOS are about 2200 who benefits in terms of credit, working tools, training, and capital
- Credit related benefits for members are as follows:
  - a) Rural employment has been increased
  - b) Food security has been attained

- c) Ability of members to pay for social services has increased
- The project has employed experts of MVIWATA, which now has facilities like cars, motorcycles, and computers.
- Problems related provision of financial services is as follows:
  - a) Training to both credit providers and recipients is not adequate
  - b) Frequent changes of cooperative policies in the country
  - c) Changes of weather
  - d) MVIWATA is yet effective/robust at intermediate level (region) for it to offer services to its members

### ***Participation of MVIWATA members***

- Participation of MVIWATA members at National and region level is based on its organization – Members, Groups, Smaller group networks in villages, intermediate regional level and national level. For this structure the problem starts at members level, thus MVIWATA at national level plans for/starts a project to address problems which rise from members in groups and rural networks
- Communication between MVIWATA and farmers is eased by its organizational structure. Communication is made through its specific means which are:
  - a) Constitutional meetings of groups
  - b) Constitutional meetings in rural group networks
  - c) Constitutional meetings at regional level
  - d) Constitutional meetings at national level
  - e) Also through different workshops and meetings organized by MVIWATA, through its newsletter 'Pambazuko' and radio broadcasts programmes

### ***MVIWATA and EC support***

- Aspects of EC support which are have been beneficial include presence of the regional fund for lending to SACCOS in the project
- Empowerment of an organisation of farmers to protect our interests and representing farmers
- Areas of weaknesses are as follows:
  - a) The available fund is inadequate. Existing SACCOS have not yet benefited directly from the this support
  - b) Further training is still required

- c) The cooperative policies are not helpful to farmers' organizations in rural areas which are poor. For example according to the new law SACCOS has to have a capital of not less than TShs 500 million to qualify for loan from financial institutions
  - d) Conflicting national cooperative policies and policies of support organizations – e.g. policies of FERT and that of the Ministry of Cooperatives
  - e) The time requesting support until disbursement is too long
- Plans and arrangement for EC support can be improved further if: farmers through MVIWATA would be given a stake to participate in planning and budgeting for the EC support instead just being involved. Thus, EC has to revisit its policies in supporting MVIWATA

ANNEX  
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

S/N	Name	Organisation
1	I.L. Tarimo	MVIWATA – Kilimanjaro
2	D.Hashan	J.SACCOS
3	S.J.P. Chuwa	J.SACCOS
4	Elijah Matee	KNCU
5	Cornel Mushi	MVIWATA – Kilimanjaro
6	Visent Mushi	Mgungani SACCOS
7	Samuel Mallya	Mgungani SACCOS
8	Sebastian Assenga	TCCIA
9	Hazina Athumore	Mgungani SACCOS
10	Benny Kisimbo	MVIWATAMWA
11	Ester Silayo	J. SACCOS
12	Imma Mchomvu	J. SACCOS
13	Helen Usiri	Nronga Women’s Dairy
14	Boniface Moesaive	Jitegemee SACCO
15.	Rhoda Swai	Kindi SACCO
16.	Pascal Makoi	Kindi SACCO
17.	Frank Urio	F.E.R.T.
18.	Rajabu Hamisi	Mviwahesa
19.	Edisani Amani	Mviwahesa
20.	Waziri Mshana	Ushamiru SACCO
21.	Tatu Juma	Mviwata – Kilimanjaro
22.	Joseph Silaya	TECSSO Rombo